

District: Sutton
School Name: Sutton Middle/High School
Category: Preferred Schematic
Date: January 27, 2010

Recommendation:

That the Executive Director is authorized to approve the Town of Sutton, as part of its Invitation for Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design for the addition/renovation of the existing Sutton Middle/High School. MSBA staff has reviewed the feasibility study and accepts the District's preferred solution to provide an addition and renovation to the Sutton Middle/High School to proceed into schematic design.

Background:

Sutton, a town with a population of approximately 8,250 residents, houses all of its public school students in a single campus facility consisting of an Early Learning Center, Elementary School, Middle School, and High School. The existing buildings are contiguous and interconnected by corridors. Students that attend Sutton Public Schools enter this campus facility in Pre-Kindergarten and remain until they graduate High School. The Sutton Middle/High School has a current enrollment of 802 students.

The existing facility consists of approximately 285,000 total gross square feet with the Middle School/High School components comprising approximately 133,000 total gross square feet, originally built in 1955 and 1949 respectively. A core building was constructed in 1989 and is located between the Middle and High School and consists of shared program and administration space utilized by both the Middle and High School contingents. The existing facility is located near the center of Sutton on a 66 acre site. Per the feasibility study, site constraints offer limited space for alternative siting locations. Existing property line limits and ground water well head locations limit the allowable building area in several sections of the site. It should be noted that there is an existing wastewater treatment plant in the southeast section of the site that processes all of the wastewater from the schools.

In the District's Statement of Interest (SOI), the District identified a number of concerns within the existing buildings, including poor air quality (HVAC), poor water quality, antiquated and inefficient plumbing systems, lack of effective building security systems, lack of fire protection systems, leaking roof systems, as well as non-compliant accessibility issues (the building is not entirely ADA compliant). In addition to the physical plant issues, the District identified programmatic and space deficiencies including undersized classrooms, lack of space for specialized programs. The District is currently utilizing space in the adjacent Elementary School to accommodate Middle School programs.

In 2006, during the public school construction moratorium period, the Town of Sutton hired Flansburgh Architects Inc to perform a feasibility study to explore the issues and deficiencies at the Sutton/Middle High School. This feasibility study found that due mostly to the age of the buildings, the original systems have deteriorated and have reached the end of their useful life. The study included several options ranging from no-build, various addition-renovation options, and new construction.

The MSBA Board of Directors voted to issue an invitation to the Town of Sutton in November of 2007 to conduct a feasibility study for the Sutton Middle/High School to identify and study possible solutions and, through a collaborative process with the MSBA reach a mutually-agreed upon solution.

The Town of Sutton retained the services of Flansburgh Architects Inc. to conduct a feasibility study of the Sutton Middle/High School. Several options from Flansburgh's previous study as well as five new options were evaluated and have been presented to the MSBA for consideration. Of the options explored and in conjunction with the design team the District further evaluated options for status-quo, no-build, four addition-renovation options and one new construction option as follows:

- **Status-quo** – This option was determined not to be acceptable due to its lack of addressing space deficiencies. Undersized classrooms and lack of space for special education are contributing factors for the accreditation warning status of the school. Since all of the Town's schools are on the same site, occupancy is already being shifted to the lower grades and is impacting the lower grade programs.
- **No-build** – This option consists of modernizing the existing school buildings to resolve life safety and deteriorating mechanical and electrical systems. This option is not acceptable to the District for reasons similar to the status-quo option. This option does not address the space deficiencies or the educational goals of the Town to meet current curriculum demands.
- **Option A** – This option consists of a renovation/ addition where the existing high school is retained and renovated, core space is renovated to accommodate the high school program, and provides a new middle school, middle school gymnasium, and shared auditorium.
- **Option B** – This option consists of a renovation/ addition where the existing middle school and high school are replaced, the core is renovated, and a new middle school gymnasium and shared auditorium are provided.
- **Option C** – This option consists of a renovation/ addition similar to 'Option B' where the existing middle school and high school are replaced, the core is renovated and a new middle school gymnasium and shared auditorium are

provided. In this option the configuration and layout of the middle school does not protrude into and does not conflict with the existing playing fields. Due to the limited amount of available space on the existing site, retaining the existing playing fields is of major importance to the District. The layout of this option assumes a protection zone set at a 300' radius centered at the existing wells limiting flexibility of building layout and configuration. This option was initially identified as the District's preferred option prior to the development of 'Option DC-1.'

- **Option D** – This option replaces the existing middle school, core, and high school with new construction.
- **Option DC-1 'Preferred Option'** – This option consists of a renovation/ addition option which was received by MSBA staff subsequent to the District's feasibility study submission and presented at the Facilities Sub-committee meeting on January 20, 2010 as the District's new preferred option. This option further defines the building development restrictions of existing well-head protection zones. The refined well-head radius restrictions are 162' from the center of the existing well-heads. The design team reconfigured the layout of the proposed middle-high school based on the flexibility of the updated well-head protection zones. At the District's request and given a less restricted area to build on, the designer was able to achieve a separate 'stand alone' configuration for the middle-high school. The preferred layout remains in close proximity to the existing elementary school and the connection, if any, to both buildings remains to be determined. This option replaces the existing middle and high school components and retains the 1989 core building components including the high school gymnasium which will be renovated.

Discussion

MSBA staff has received and reviewed the Designer's feasibility study submission indicating the preferred option selected by the District and the options that have been explored on behalf of the District. MSBA staff has reviewed and discussed the options and corresponding space summaries with the District and the Designer to better understand which educational program is most-beneficial and efficient for the Sutton Middle/High School in accordance with MSBA guidelines. Staff has addressed areas of concern with respect to the program and overall space required to accommodate the District's program and have come to a mutual agreement for the preferred option.

The options listed above were individually evaluated by the District and of the several alternative options explored initially in the previous study, four options were further evaluated as determined by the District as being the options that most favorably address the District's educational goals, construction cost criteria, and operational cost. The five options including preliminary project cost that have been further evaluated by the District are as follows:

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing

Option (Description)	Enrollment (Grades)	Total Gross SF	SF of Renovated Space (Cost/SF)	SF of New Construction (Cost/SF)	Estimated Total Construction Cost (Cost/SF)
Option A - Renovation/Addition	840 (6-12)	192,500	125,000 (\$248/SF)	67,500 (\$320/SF)	\$52.6M (\$273/SF)
Option B - Renovation/Addition	840 (6-12)	184,079	68,978 (\$249/SF)	115,101 (\$310/SF)	\$64.7M (\$287/SF)
Option C - Renovation/Addition	840 (6-12)	182,807	68,978 (\$236/SF)	113,829 (\$297/SF)	\$50.1M (\$274/SF)
Option D - New Construction	840 (6-12)	177,500	4,000* (\$118/SF)	173,500 (\$306/SF)	\$53.6M (\$302/SF)
Option DC1 - Renovation/Addition	840 (6-12)	179,942	61,632 (\$207/SF)	118,310 (\$305/SF)	\$48.9M (\$271/SF)

*Renovation of Central Administration excluded from any MSBA grant for all proposed projects.

Based upon the estimated costs, the District and its design team have determined that the most cost-effective solution is for the addition/renovation construction 'Option DC-1' as it provides for the lowest square footage of the addition/renovation options, most energy-efficient facility and lowest estimated total project cost to meet the educational program.

MSBA has reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed including an executed Initial Certificate of Compliance, the composition of the School Building committee and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and have reached a mutual agreement with the District of a design enrollment of 840 students for the Sutton Middle/High School.
- 3) MSBA reviewed the feasibility study and subsequent material and finds that the alternatives investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in their scope and that the District's preferred option is reasonable.

- 4) MSBA will require the District to produce an operational maintenance budget that will include a capital budget to assure a complete maintenance and capital improvement program for the District.
- 5) MSBA staff previously completed its review of the proposed space summary for the District's initially preferred option 'C' and provided comments to the District. Given the recent adjustments to the preferred addition/ renovation option that have materialized subsequent to the initial review, it is necessary for staff to verify that any changes to the space summary for the new preferred option 'DC-1' remain in line with the previous parameters established and in compliance with the MSBA guidelines. It should be noted that the MSBA has identified District-wide spaces within the proposed program that will be ineligible for reimbursement. These spaces have been categorized in the 'Other' category of the MSBA space summary template.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Sutton be approved to proceed into schematic design to provide addition to and renovate the existing Sutton Middle/High School.