

District: Winchester  
 School Name: Vinson-Owen Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: July 28, 2010

Recommendation:

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Winchester as part of its Invitation for Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design for the replacement of the Vinson-Owen Elementary School. MSBA staff has reviewed the feasibility study and accepts the District's preferred solution to replace the existing school with the construction of a new K-5 Vinson-Owen Elementary School.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name:	Town of Winchester
Elementary Schools:	5 (Ambrose, Lincoln, Lynch, Muraco, Vinson-Owen)
Middle Schools:	1 (McCall MS)
High School:	1 (Winchester HS)
Priority School Name:	Vinson-Owen ES
Type of School:	Elementary
Grades Served:	K-5
Year Opened:	1961
Total Square Footage:	33,140 with modular classrooms, 27,950 without modular units
Additions:	None
Acreage of Site:	9.3
Building Issues:	<p>The existing school does not meet the enrollment needs and the aging facility does not support their educational program.</p> <p>Deficiencies include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- The envelope systems &amp; finishes are at the end of their useful life.</li> <li>- The current facility has significant ADA / handicapped accessibility deficiencies due to the three tier building plan stepping up the hill without elevators or lifts.</li> <li>- The existing facility does not have basic program spaces such as cafeteria, kitchen, computer classrooms or adequate area for the library, nurses, administration, gym, custodial and toilet facilities.</li> <li>- Flat areas of the site (play fields and parking) are filled wetlands containing poor bearing capacity soils conditions.</li> <li>- There are significant wetland, no-build zones &amp; rocky wooded areas onsite.</li> </ul>
Original Design Capacity:	189 (326 including modular classrooms)
2009-2010 Enrollment:	287
Agreed Upon Enrollment:	420
Enrollment Specifics:	A mutually agreed upon design enrollment of 420 students serving Grades K-5 which includes redistricting its elementary schools as follows: Ambrose ES, Lincoln ES and Muraco ES (net reduction of

<b>District Information</b>	
	60 students each), Lynch ES (net addition of 80 students); resulting in a proposed Vincent-Owen ES enrollment increase of 100 students.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Feasibility Study:	November 28, 2007
Preferred Schematic Authorization:	The District is targeting Board authorization on July 28, 2010
Project Scope & Budget Authorization:	The District is targeting Board authorization on November 17, 2010

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager	RF Walsh Collaborative Partners
Designer	Tappe Associates, Inc.

## **Discussion**

The District and the MSBA mutually agreed to consider options that included increasing the existing capacity of the Vinson-Owen Elementary School by 100 students to alleviate district-wide overcrowding through redistricting. Therefore, all options considered as part of the District's feasibility study assume a K-5 elementary school with a 420 student population.

The District considered student assignments within the District, potential opportunities for tuition agreements with adjacent districts, and the use of existing educational space through leasing or acquisition, and has determined that none of these options are viable due to the age and inadequacies of the existing building, overcrowded school facilities, and increasing enrollment throughout the District. The District, in conjunction with its Designer, initially considered five options, including one renovation/addition option and four new options. These options were compared and evaluated to determine which options best met the community, educational, design (building and site), facilities, environmental and fiscal goals (basic comparative costs were included in this evaluation) established by the School Building Committee and its Designer. The report notes that steep slopes and poor soil conditions in the flat play-field area limit buildable area on the site, resulting in inefficiencies in the building layout and higher project costs.

Based upon the estimated costs and evaluation summarized in Table 1 below, the District and its Designer have determined that the most cost effective solution that meets the District's educational needs and priorities is to replace the existing Vinson-Owen Elementary School serving grades K-5 with a new elementary school serving the same grades. The District has selected Option E Revised, a new (partial) three-story elementary school as its preferred option to proceed into schematic design.

**Table 1 – Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing**

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Enrollment (Grades)</b>	<b>Total Gross SF</b>	<b>SF of Renovated Space (Cost/SF)</b>	<b>SF of New Construction (Cost/SF)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction (Cost/SF)</b>
<b>Option A</b> Reno / Addition	420 (K-5)	73,150	21,650 (\$345.63)	51,500 (\$312.57)	\$23,580,042 (\$322.35)
<b>Option B</b> New on existing slope	420 (K-5)	73,971	-	73,971 (\$327.74)	\$24,184,380 (\$327.74)
<b>Option C</b> New on lower slope	420 (K-5)	74,170	-	74,170 (\$310.16)	\$23,004,247 (\$310.16)
<b>Option D</b> New on existing field	420 (K-5)	74,826	-	74,826 (\$320.92)	\$24,013,280 (\$320.92)
<b>Option E</b> New on slope at rear of field, demo gym	420 (K-5)	74,235	-	74,235 (\$310.50)	\$23,050,227 (\$310.50)
<sup>1</sup> <b>Option E Revised</b> <i>New at rear of field</i>	<b>420</b> <b>(K-5)</b>	<b>74,774</b>	-	<b>74,774</b> <b>(\$303.77)</b>	<b>\$22,714,061</b> <b>(\$303.77)</b>

***1-District's Preferred Option***

Although the renovation/addition option would provide the required programmatic spaces, there are a number of significant shortcomings with this option, including: providing accessibility for the handicapped would be difficult and would require three elevators; it fails to include needed improvements in site circulation and parking; it requires complex and disruptive construction phasing; and, it is not estimated to be cost effective. The new construction options are similar in costs, all improve on site conditions, and all organize grades vertically, with two grades per floor, which supports the District's team approach to delivery of its curriculum. Options B, C, and D, were not selected due to site difficulties and costs, undesirable building arrangements, and extensive phasing. Option E is similar to Option C except for the building location on the site. Option E Revised, a refined version of Option E, provides better educational adjacencies within the building, increased outdoor play area and is expected to improve traffic flow. The District preferred Option E Revised, citing lower costs, better building arrangement and location.

***Option E Revised*** proposes the construction of a new facility on the existing Vinson-Owen site, located in the sloping area of the site, at the rear of the existing field. Phasing of construction will include requirements for off-site swing-space. The building's main entrance will face south towards green space, a play area, and bus access. The majority of core spaces are located on the first floor, with two classroom floors above. The existing building will be demolished upon completion of the new construction, after which the final roads and parking will be completed.

MSBA staff has reviewed and discussed the options and corresponding space summaries with the District and the Designer to better understand which educational program is most beneficial and efficient for the Town of Winchester in accordance with MSBA guidelines. MSBA staff has received, reviewed and accepts the Designer's feasibility study submission that identifies the

options that have been explored on behalf of the District and the preferred option selected by the District.

On June 23, 2010, the Town of Winchester and its Designer presented their proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee. Based on this meeting, the District was asked to consider providing voice enhancement technology in the classrooms, consider switching locations of the Art Room and Computer Lab, indicate on the subsequent submittals the future areas of building expansion, and analyze the location and the curved configuration of the building to minimize construction costs.

MSBA has reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed including an executed Initial Certificate of Compliance, the composition of the School Building committee and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and reached a mutual agreement with the District of a design enrollment of 420 students for the Vinson-Owen Elementary School.
- 3) MSBA reviewed the feasibility study and subsequent supplementary material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in their scope, that the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and that the District's preferred option is reasonable and cost effective.
- 4) An operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget have been submitted to the MSBA for review.
- 5) MSBA staff will work with the District to establish a design budget and an understanding of MSBA considerations and levels of funding.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Winchester be approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing grade K-5 Vinson-Owen Elementary School with the construction of a new grade K-5 Vinson-Owen Elementary School on the existing site.

# MSBA Preliminary Reimbursement Rate Summary

Winchester

<u>MSBA Reimbursement Rate Calculation</u>	
Base Points	31.00
Income Factor	-
Property Wealth Factor	2.95
Poverty Factor	-
Racial Desegregation Plan Approved prior to 6/30/2000	-
<i>Subtotal: Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives</i>	33.95
<b><u>Incentive Points *</u></b>	
Maintenance (0-2)	-
CM @ Risk (0-1)	-
Newly Formed Regional District (0-6)	-
Major Reconstruction or Reno/Reuse (0-5)	-
Overlay Zoning 40R & 40S (0-1)	-
Overlay Zoning 100 units or 50% of units for 1, 2 or 3 family structures (0-0.5)	-
Energy Efficiency - "Green Schools" (0-2)	-
Model Schools (5)	-
<b>Total Incentive Points</b>	-
<b>Additional Points Necessary for 40% Minimum</b>	6.05
<b>MSBA Reimbursement Rate</b>	<b>40.00%</b>

\* Incentive Points will be added to District's reimbursement rate before 40% minimum is applied.