

District: Town of Williamsburg
 School Name: Anne T. Dunphy Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: September 21, 2011

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Williamsburg, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design for an addition and renovation project at the existing Anne T. Dunphy Elementary School, including the re-districting of grades PreK-2 currently housed at the Helen E. James Elementary School. MSBA staff reviewed the Feasibility Study and accept the District’s preferred solution of an addition and renovations to the existing Anne T. Dunphy Elementary School.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Williamsburg
Elementary School(s)	Anne T. Dunphy Elementary School (3-6) Helen E. James Elementary School (PreK-2)
Middle School(s)	None
High School(s)	Students attend the Hampshire Regional High School (7-12) in the Hampshire Regional School District.
Priority School Name	Anne T. Dunphy Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	3-6
Year Opened	1953
Total Square Footage	21,935
Additions	1986, renovations included windows, peaked roof, handicap accessible bathroom, and wheelchair lift to the stage
Acreage of Site	7.5 acres
Building Issues	The District noted deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - ADA compliance issues - Antiquated HVAC systems - Overcrowding - Poor ventilation - Accessibility <p>In addition to physical plant issues, the District reported overcrowding.</p>
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2010-2011 Enrollment	74 (3-6)
Agreed Upon Enrollment	A Study Enrollment Certification was signed on August 16, 2010 in support of grade configuration for a study of 170 students for grades K-6 and 100 students for grades 3-6.
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon approval by the MSBA Board of Directors of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment

District Information	
	Certification.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	July 29, 2009
Preferred Schematic Authorization	September 28, 2011
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on November 16, 2011
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	56.89%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Arcadis
Designer	Drummey Rosane Anderson, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Dunphy School, the District's prioritized Statement of Interest, is a 22,000 square-foot, one-story wood, steel, and brick masonry structure built in 1953 and located on approximately 7.5 acres serving grades 3-6. The Williamsburg School District consists of two elementary schools, the second being the Helen E. James Elementary School located within one quarter mile of the Dunphy School and serving grades K-2.

As part of its Feasibility Study, the District considered multiple options ranging from modest updates and renovations to one or both facilities, substantial upgrades to the existing facilities, and new construction options. One of the District's goals was to explore an option that combined the student populations of the Dunphy and James schools into a single facility, creating a K-6 grade structure.

On August 19, 2011, the District submitted its Feasibility Study Report to the MSBA. The Feasibility Study Report outlines and describes the following five alternatives considered:

Option A – The District's baseline option presented for comparison purposes, it considers only maintenance and necessary capital improvements for both schools in order for the District's continued use. The scope does not include life safety and accessibility improvements.

Option B – Renovation of both the James and Dunphy schools. This option considers comprehensive renovations of both schools but does not include additions to either. In this option, the existing square footage is maintained, which consequently minimizes the flexibility of layout adjustments required to accommodate the District's educational program. The student populations of K-2 and 3-6 remain in separate facilities.

Option C – Addition and renovation to the James School. This option combines the student population into one K-6 grade structure and considers comprehensive renovations and an addition to the existing James School, including full replacement of the MEP systems, windows, and doors. Comprehensive site upgrades would be required to accommodate the adjusted grade structure and

provide safe and efficient pedestrian and vehicular traffic. The site is constrained by nearby wetlands and the buildable area is limited in this option, resulting in reduced recreational space. The existing building does not include a gymnasium; one would have to be added to the total square footage required to deliver the District’s educational program.

Option D – Addition and renovation to the Dunphy School. This option combines the student population into a K-6 grade structure and considers comprehensive renovations and addition to the existing Dunphy School. Option D contains two sub-options, D1 and D2. Option D1 explores the feasibility of a courtyard scheme with all of the primary educational spaces organized around a central courtyard. Option D2 organizes the early education classrooms within an addition at the front of the building, while grades 1 through 6 are organized in a wing toward the back of the building. Option D2 succeeds in creating distinct wings for the different age groups while clustering the shared spaces such as the Commons, Music, Art, and Science between the two wings for direct access by either group. Renovations associated with this option include full replacement of all MEP systems, removal of hazardous materials, exterior envelope renovations, and replacement/upgrade of interior finishes.

Option E – New construction at the Dunphy School site. This option considers the demolition of the existing Dunphy School and the construction of a new facility for grades K-6. The new building would be located in close proximity to the existing structure so as to (1) maintain use and relationship with the parking and drop-off area, (2) avoid construction close to wetlands, and (3) maximize recreational space used on-site. The new construction option addresses all of the physical plant and programmatic issues for the District, but it may not present the best plan for meeting all of the project goals in consideration of cost. Preliminary estimates indicate that the cost of new construction would be the most expensive option and would have the greatest cost impact to the Town.

Table 1 – Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Footage	Square Footage of Renovated Space (cost/sf)*	Square Footage of New* Construction (cost/sf)*	Site, Building takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction (cost/sf)*	Estimated Project Costs
A – No build/ Limited renovation	45,794	45,794 (\$64.12/sf)	n/a	\$463,440	\$2,936,423 (\$64.12/sf)	\$3,764,645
B – Renovation of both schools	45,794	45,794 (\$209.02/sf)	n/a	\$1,874,522	\$9,571,789 (\$209.02/sf)	\$12,271,524
C – Addition/renovation James Elementary School	41,311	23,564 (\$211.22/sf)	17,747 (\$314.58/sf)	\$2,449,113	\$10,559,939 (\$255.62/sf)	\$13,538,383
D1 – Addition/renovation Dunphy Elementary School	40,286	22,230 (\$221.94/sf)	18,056 (\$297.66/sf)	\$2,393,637	\$10,308,268 (\$255.88/sf)	\$13,215,728

D2 – Addition/renovation Dunphy Elementary School**	38,038	22,230 (\$221.94/sf)	15,808 (\$313.91/sf)	\$2,311,249	\$9,896,032 (\$260.16/sf)	\$12,687,220
E – New Construction	37,500	n/a	37,500 (\$323.22/sf)	\$2,042,147	\$12,120,614 (\$323.22/sf)	\$15,539,248

* *Marked-up construction costs*

** *District's Preferred Option*

Based on an evaluation of the options listed above, the District has selected Option D2, renovation and addition of the Dunphy School as its preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District believes that Option D2 best meets the needs of the District's programmatic goals and will result in an updated, energy-efficient facility that addresses the deficiencies identified in the Statement of Interest.

MSBA staff reviewed and discussed the options and corresponding space summaries with the District and the Designer to better understand which educational program is most beneficial and efficient for the Town of Williamsburg in accordance with MSBA guidelines. After review, MSBA staff accept the Designer's Feasibility Study submission that identifies the options that have been explored on behalf of the District and the preferred solution selected by the District.

MSBA staff have reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 170 students for the Anne T. Dunphy Elementary School.
- 3) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable, cost effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 4) An operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget have been submitted to the MSBA for review.
- 5) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Williamsburg be approved to proceed into schematic design for an addition and renovations to the existing Anne T. Dunphy Elementary School, including the re-districting of grades PreK-2 currently housed at the

Helen E. James Elementary School. The District has established a committee to explore re-use options for the Helen E. James Elementary School but does not have definitive plans for the facility at this time.