

District: City of Revere
 School Name: William McKinley Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: September 26, 2012

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Revere, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing William McKinley Elementary School with the construction of a new PK-5 facility, to be located at the Hill Park site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the City's preferred solution to replace the existing school with the construction of a new William McKinley Elementary School at the Hill Park site, contingent upon the City obtaining full ownership, control, and use of the site.

| District Information | |
|-----------------------------|---|
| District Name | City of Revere |
| Elementary School(s) | Abraham Lincoln School (PK-5) Garfield Elementary School (PK-5) William McKinley Elementary School (PK-5) Paul Revere School (PK-6) A.C. Whelan School (K-5) Beachmont Veterans Memorial School (K-5) |
| Middle School(s) | Garfield Middle School (6-8) Rumney Marsh Academy (6-8) Susan B. Anthony Middle School for the Arts (6-8) |
| High School(s) | Revere High School (9-12) Seacoast High School (9-12) |
| Priority School Name | William McKinley Elementary School |
| Type of School | Elementary School |
| Grades Served | PK-5 |
| Year Opened | 1905 |
| Total Square Footage | 43,570 |
| Additions | Two: 1930, 1954 |
| Acreage of Site | Approximately 1.15 acres |
| Building Issues | The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural integrity - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Envelope - Windows - Roof - Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported existing and projected overcrowding and that the building limits the delivery of its educational program. |
| Original Design Capacity | 392 |
| 2011-2012 Enrollment | 483 |

| District Information | |
|-----------------------------|--|
| Agreed Upon Enrollment | 690 |
| Enrollment Specifics | The City of Revere and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 690 students for grades K-5, for a project that will serve grades PK-5 and potentially relieve overcrowding in the Lincoln and Whelan Elementary Schools through redistricting. |

| MSBA Board Votes | |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Invitation to Feasibility Study | March 28, 2012 |
| Preferred Schematic Authorization | On October 3, 2012 Board agenda |
| Project Scope & Budget Authorization | City is targeting Board authorization in January, 2013 |
| Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives | 80.00% |

| Consultants | |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Owner's Project Manager | Collaborative Partners |
| Designer | Drummey Rosane Anderson, Inc. |

Discussion

The existing William McKinley Elementary School is an historic three-story masonry building on a 1.15-acre site located on Yeamans Street in the City of Revere. The existing building is 43,570 square feet and serves a portion of the City's grade K-5 population. The original school building was constructed in 1905. Upgrades and additions were completed in 1930 and 1954. The City identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest including the need for accessibility upgrades, system upgrades, and envelope improvements.

The existing structure consists of masonry bearing walls supporting wood framing at each level. The building façade appears to be in relatively good condition, and there is no apparent distress or settlement at the foundations. However, due to the age of the building, significant structural upgrades would be required as part of a potential renovation or addition project. The existing HVAC, plumbing, and electrical systems are, for the most part, original to the building, beyond their useful life, and in need of complete replacement. The building has no fire protection system and is in need of new windows throughout. Both the site and the building fail to meet handicapped accessibility standards, and the site has inadequate space for parking and play areas.

During the Feasibility Study, the City was challenged to evaluate options that addressed the demonstrated enrollment growth within the City, the historic nature of the existing building, the constrained site, and the relatively few cost-effective alternative sites for new construction within the City.

Based on information provided by the City, the MSBA understood that the McKinley Elementary School District is geographically situated to allow for redistricting of the Lincoln and Whelan School districts to alleviate projected overcrowding in the elementary grades. Therefore, contingent on the City's implementation of a redistricting plan to alleviate this overcrowding, the

City and the MSBA agreed to a design enrollment of 690 students in grades K-5 for the potential project.

During recent communications with the City, the City has expressed concern about the rate of enrollment growth within the existing McKinley School district, and the belief that there is potential for filling the proposed new, larger building without redistricting. The MSBA agrees that enrollment is increasing; however, a draft redistricting plan is required, and the enrollment will be monitored as the project progresses to determine the extent of redistricting that may be necessary to fill the proposed new facility.

The projected growth in enrollment, as well as the City’s stated goal to redistrict, resulted in an agreed-upon design enrollment that is larger than the current facility can support. While, in general, the classrooms within the building are sized appropriately compared to MSBA guidelines, the existing building contains approximately half of the classrooms required to accommodate the design enrollment. In addition, the existing building lacks a gymnasium and has significantly undersized spaces dedicated to support dining and food service, special education, art, and music curricula. The City reports that the physical constraints of the building compromise its ability to deliver its educational program.

In conjunction with its consultants, the City performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the City and its consultants initially studied five preliminary options that included two addition/renovation options and three new construction options. Upon further review, MSBA staff and the City agreed to further develop these five options, and consider them in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

| Option (Description) | Total Gross Square Feet | Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf) | Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf) | Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost* | Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf) | Estimated Total Project Costs |
|--|--|--|---|--|---|--|
| Option A: (Repair) | 47,120 | 43,570 \$140/sf | 3,550 \$420/sf | \$620,000 | \$7,600,000 \$162/sf | \$12,800,000 |
| Option B: (Addition/ Renovation) | 102,039 | 43,570 \$195/sf | 58,469 \$340/sf | \$1,530,000 | \$29,800,000 \$293/sf | \$43,400,000 |
| Option C: (New Construction at Existing Site) | 94,500 | N/A | 94,500 \$307/sf | \$1,830,000 | \$29,040,000 \$307/sf | \$42,000,000 |
| Option D: (New Construction at Della Russo Stadium Site) | 95,000 | N/A | 95,000 \$323/sf | \$2,300,000 | \$30,700,000 \$323/sf | \$45,600,000 |

| Option (Description) | Total Gross Square Feet | Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf) | Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf) | Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost* | Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf) | Estimated Total Project Costs |
|--|--|--|---|--|---|--|
| Option E: (New Construction at Hill Park Site)*** | 97,000 | N/A | 97,000 \$325/sf | \$1,950,000 | \$31,500,000 \$325/sf | \$41,700,000 |

* *Marked-up construction costs*

** *Does not include construction contingency*

*** *District's preferred option*

The estimated total project costs shown above do not include all of the short-term and long-term costs associated with each option, such as the costs for land takings, temporary placement of students during construction, the eventual renovation or repurposing of the existing McKinley facility, and replacement of City or community assets such as the football stadium or federally-protected parkland. However, the City did consider the additional short-term and long-term costs in determining its preferred option, and the City understands and agrees that these costs would not be eligible for MSBA reimbursement.

Due to the constraints of the existing site, and the need to provide a much larger program than currently exists due to enrollment growth, the City determined that the repair and addition/renovation options were not feasible, in part, because of the number of land takings that would be required to construct an appropriately-sized addition. Similarly, the City and its consultants determined that construction of a new building on the existing site would be impractical because it would require the demolition of an historic building and a minimum of six land takings, and the project would have significant impact on students during construction.

The Della Russo Stadium and Hill Park sites abut each other and are located in close proximity to the existing McKinley School. New construction at the Della Russo Stadium site would require the immediate replacement of the City's high school football facilities at an estimated cost of approximately \$3.5 million, borne fully by the City. The Hill Park site is federally-funded parkland, the use of which is restricted under Article 97 of the Massachusetts Constitution. It is the MSBA's understanding that new construction on this site would require replacement of the existing parkland with parkland of equal or greater value elsewhere in the community as well as further local action and approval and a two-thirds vote of the Legislature. However, this option allows the continued use of the existing football stadium, thereby deferring the cost of relocation or refurbishment. The cost of replacing the existing parkland, borne fully by the City, is estimated to be \$1.5 million.

After careful consideration of the options presented above, the City has selected as its preferred option, New Construction at the Hill Park Site, Option E, as the most cost-effective and least disruptive to the students and community. The City selected this solution as its preferred option because it allows the City to meet the needs of its educational program as well as address the deficiencies described in the Statement of Interest.

The City has acknowledged and agreed that, all appropriate approvals related to the acquisition of the federally-protected parkland must be in place, and full ownership, control, and use of the proposed site must be secured, prior to the execution of a Project Funding Agreement with the MSBA.

The City presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on September 12, 2012. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised a number of concerns, including the following:

- The potential future costs the City will incur by repurposing/renovating the existing William McKinley School;
- Analysis of phased addition/renovation options that minimize the requirement for land acquisition;
- Current or planned design elements that allow for flexibility of the building design to handle enrollment growth in the future and to allocate an appropriate amount of space for outside play areas;
- The potential for the circulation areas within the building to be creatively designed to offer opportunities for break-out areas or small group spaces;
- The potential for implementing a redistricting plan that allows for a “Buffer Zone” between elementary school districts; and
- The City’s long-term plan regarding enrollment growth and that, prior to undertaking any future school construction projects, the City must develop a Master Plan for the schools that addresses the projected enrollment needs, capacity, and infrastructure issues among its facilities. In addition, the plan should address the City’s efforts to further understand the impact of current and future development and growth on its school population, and the effect of this on the City’s inventory of school facilities.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the City and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the City for a design enrollment of 690 students for the William McKinley Elementary School. This agreement includes redistricting to relieve overcrowding in the Lincoln and Whelan Elementary School districts.
- 3) The City acknowledges that it must provide a locally-approved, draft redistricting plan showing the potential district lines and how they affect the enrollment at the redistricted schools. This draft plan, and certificates of local approvals, will be required as part of the Schematic Design phase of the project.
- 4) The City has acknowledged that full ownership, control, and use of the proposed site is a prerequisite for the execution of a Project Funding Agreement.

- 5) The City must secure full control and ownership of the proposed site within 120 days of approval by the MSBA Board of Directors of the proposed project, and any such approval will be conditional upon securing full ownership, control, and use of the property.
- 6) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the City's preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the City.
- 7) The City will submit an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.
- 8) The City's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Revere be approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing William McKinley Elementary School with the construction of a new PK-5 facility to be located at the Hill Park site, contingent upon the City obtaining full ownership, control, and use of the site.