District: Town of Lexington
School Name: Joseph Estabrook Elementary School
Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
Date: January 18, 2012

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Lexington as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Estabrook Elementary School on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's preferred solution to replace the existing school with the construction of a new Estabrook Elementary School on the existing site.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Lexington
Elementary School(s)	Fiske Elementary School (K-5) Bowman Elementary School (K-5) Bridge Elementary School (K-5) Hastings Elementary School (K-5) Harrington Elementary School (K-5) Joseph Estabrook Elementary School (K-5)
Middle School(s)	Diamond Middle School (6-8) Clarke Middle School (6-8)
High School	Lexington High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Joseph Estabrook Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K–5
Year Opened	1961
Total Square Footage	60,707
Additions	None – 3 Modulars are utilized
Acreage of Site	7.5 acres
Building Issues	The District noted deficiencies in the following areas: - Exterior Walls and Windows - Roof - HVAC - Plumbing - Electrical - Fire protection - Airborne concentration of PCBs above EPA acceptable limits In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing layout inhibits delivery of its educational program. The building also lacks a cafeteria.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2010-2011 Enrollment	455
Agreed Upon Enrollment	540
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 540 students serving grades K-5.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	February 9, 2011
Preferred Schematic Authorization	January 25, 2012
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization in March 28, 2012
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	33.96%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	RF Walsh Collaborative Partners
Designer	DiNisco Design Partnership, Limited

The existing Estabrook Elementary School is a 60,707 square-foot facility located on a relatively flat site in a largely residential area of Lexington. The existing facility currently houses grades K-5.

In 2006, the District engaged Design Partnership of Cambridge to develop a 10-year, elementary school Master Plan for the District. This was supplemented in 2009, resulting in a district-wide, 10-year K-12 Master Plan. According to the Master Plan, the District was planning on renovating or replacing the Estabrook School starting in 2014. In August of 2011, the District received the results of a hazardous materials study highlighting unacceptable concentrations of PCBs in the indoor air at the Estabrook School. The District has reported that it took immediate actions to bring the PCB concentrations to an acceptable level prior to the start of the school year, and implemented an air monitoring program.

In conjunction with the design team, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its design team initially studied four preliminary options that included one addition/renovation option and three new construction options as follows:

Option	Description
1	**Addition/Renovation to Existing School** – 36-month construction duration for the renovation of approximately 56,262 gross square feet of the existing building and construction of an approximately 34,085 gross square-foot addition
2	**New Construction of a 2-Story School** – 18-month construction duration for the construction of an approximately 90,000 gross square-foot building
3	**New Construction of a 3-Story School** – 18-month construction duration for the construction of an approximately 90,000 gross square-foot building
4	**New Construction of a 3-Story Model School** – 18-month construction duration for the construction of an approximately 90,000 gross square-foot building

Early in the Feasibility Study process, it became apparent that the extensive level of work required for an addition/renovation project would cost nearly as much as new construction, and new

construction options should be evaluated further. Site constraints were a significant factor in determining which two new construction options should be developed further. Based on project meetings with MSBA staff and responses to the comments made by the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee, the District and its design team modified the two new construction options, resulting in the options described below:

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 2: (New 2-Story Building)	90,000	N/A	90,000 $296/sf	$4,499,892	$31,139,202 $346/sf	$43,252,653
Option 3: (New 3-Story Building)* **	***90,000***	***N/A***	***90,000*** ***$284/sf***	***$5,223,256***	***$30,770,743*** ***$342/sf***	***$42,783,546***

** Marked up construction costs*
*** Does not include construction contingency*
******District's preferred option***

The District has selected Option 3 as its preferred solution to proceed into schematic design for the following reasons:

- Allows for delivery of the educational program in an efficient and flexible environment
- Minimizes construction duration
- Allows for optimal site circulation and adjacencies
- Creates a safe site where the new construction is well segregated from the existing school

The District and its team investigated the advantages and disadvantages of each option and presented these to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on December 14, 2011. The FAS expressed concern regarding the size and utilization of the shared project areas at the entrances of the classrooms, including how the District intends to use these spaces, how they are being used in other schools, and the District's commitment to utilizing these areas to deliver its curriculum. The MSBA received supplemental materials on December 21, 2011 that addressed some of these issues discussed at the FAS meeting.

MSBA staff has reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment information.

2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 540 students for the Estabrook Elementary School.

3) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.

4) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.

5) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.

6) Subject to the Board's approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of the variations previously agreed to by the MSBA.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Lexington be approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Estabrook Elementary School on the existing site.