

District: Ayer Shirley Regional School District
 School Name: Ayer Shirley Regional High School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: May 30, 2012

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Ayer Shirley Regional School District, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design for an addition and renovation project at the Ayer Shirley Regional High School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution for an addition and renovation project at the Ayer Shirley Regional High School.

| District Information | |
|-----------------------------|---|
| District Name | Ayer Shirley Regional School District |
| Elementary School(s) | Page Hilltop School (PK-5) Lura A. White Elementary School (PK-5) |
| Middle School(s) | Ayer Shirley Regional Middle School (6-8) |
| High School(s) | Ayer Shirley Regional High School (9-12) |
| Priority School Name | Ayer Shirley Regional High School |
| Type of School | High School |
| Grades Served | 9-12 |
| Year Opened | 1963 |
| Total Square Footage | 143,808 |
| Additions | N/A |
| Acreage of Site | 55 acres |
| Building Issues | The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Windows - Accessibility |
| Original Design Capacity | Unknown |
| 2011-2012 Enrollment | 307 |
| Agreed Upon Enrollment | Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 495 students for 9-12 grade configuration (preferred solution) 860 students for 6-12 grade configuration |
| Enrollment Specifics | If the Board approves the District’s preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 495 students in grades 9-12. |

| MSBA Board Votes | |
|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|
| Invitation to Feasibility Study | November 18, 2009 |
| Preferred Schematic Authorization | On June 6, 2012 Board agenda |

| | |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| Project Scope & Budget Authorization | District is targeting Board authorization on October 3, 2012 |
| Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives | 56.89% |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Consultants | |
| Owner's Project Manager | Dore & Whittier Management Partners, LLC |
| Designer | Symmes Maini & McKee Associates |

Discussion

The existing Ayer Shirley Regional High School is a 143,808 square-foot building on a 55-acre site located on Washington Street in Ayer. The existing facility served grades 6-12 in the Town of Ayer until the Regional Agreement was executed in March of 2010, at which time students in grades 6-8 in Ayer started attending the Ayer Shirley Regional Middle School in Shirley. Middle School students from Shirley also attend the Ayer Shirley Regional Middle School. The existing High School facility serves grades 9-12 for the Regional District, with the Shirley population being phased into the building. Traditionally, Shirley High School students attended either Lunenburg or Ayer high schools through tuition agreements. Shirley students that started in Lunenburg High School have been allowed to continue there; however, future incoming high school students from Shirley will be attending the Ayer Shirley Regional High School.

The original school building was constructed in 1963. Upgrades and additions were completed in 1983 and 1996. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest. The existing facility requires accessibility upgrades, system upgrades, and envelope improvements.

After the Towns of Ayer and Shirley voted to form a K-12 Regional School District in March 2010, the Regional District began to pursue a project for a proposed Ayer Shirley Regional Middle/High School. With the support of the MSBA, and after procuring the services of a design team, the District conducted a Feasibility Study to determine the most educationally-appropriate and fiscally-responsible option for a project serving grades 6-12 at the existing Ayer Shirley Regional High School. As part of the Feasibility Study, the District and its consultants considered the implications of the proposed project serving grades 6-12 in the context of a district-wide, three-school Master Plan that would include the closing of the Lura A. White Elementary School in Shirley and the retrofitting of the Ayer Shirley Middle School building to accommodate the students from the White Elementary School.

During the District's consideration of the preliminary alternatives, for reasons of economy and community support, the District requested to also study options that maintained a 9-12 grade configuration. In support of this proposal, the MSBA provided a study enrollment certification for a project serving grades 9-12. The District subsequently supplemented the original list of preliminary options with three grades 9-12 options and considered the implications of changing to a Master Plan that maintained the four existing facilities as currently configured.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied 13 preliminary options: nine addition/renovation options and one new

construction option for a project serving grades 6-12; and, two addition/renovation options and one new construction option for a project serving grades 9-12. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered.

| Option | Description of Preliminary Options | Total Project Budget Estimate |
|---------------|--|--------------------------------------|
| 1A | Middle/High School Base Repair Option | \$31.2M |
| 2A | Two-Story Middle School Addition (North of Existing Building) | \$73.9M |
| 3A | Two-Story Middle and High School Addition (North of Existing Building) | \$68.8M |
| 3B | Two-Story Middle and High School Addition (East of Existing Building) | \$69.0M |
| 3C | Two-Story Middle and High School Addition (East of Existing Building) | \$68.6M |
| 4A | Three-Story Middle School Addition (West of Existing Building) | \$74.7M |
| 4B | Two-Story Middle School Addition (West of Existing Building) | \$74.9M |
| 4C | Two-Story Middle School Addition (West of Existing Building) | \$75.7M |
| 4D | Three-Story Middle School Addition (West of Existing Building) | \$71.2M |
| 5A | New Three-Story Middle/High School | \$84.9M |
| 6A | High School Only – Renovation and Minor Addition | \$47.6M |
| 6B | High School Only – Two-Story Addition to Replace Existing Academic Wings | \$52.9M |
| 6C | New Three-Story High School | \$59.5M |

After discussions with MSBA staff, the District and its consultants identified three preliminary options, options 3C, 6B.1 (a slight variation of option 6B), and 6C, for advancement into the final evaluation of alternatives as presented in the preliminary design pricing table below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

| Option (Description) | Total Gross Square Feet | Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf) | Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf) | Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost* | Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf) | Estimated Total Project Costs |
|---|--------------------------------|--|---|--|---|--------------------------------------|
| Option 3C: (Middle/High, Renovation and Addition) | 194,458 | 132,590 \$232/sf | 61,868 \$319/sf | \$6,100,000 | \$56,600,000 \$292/sf | \$71,000,000 |
| Option 6C: (New High School) | 126,646 | - | 126,646 \$322/sf | \$8,300,000 | \$49,100,000 \$387/sf | \$61,600,000 |
| Option 6B.1: (High School, Renovation and Addition)*** | 144,686 | 88,511 \$247/sf | 56,175 \$289/sf | \$5,700,000 | \$43,700,000 \$302/sf | \$54,900,000 |

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

***District's preferred option

The District selected an addition/renovation option (Option 6B.1) with a 9-12 grade configuration for the High School as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District and its consultants concluded that the selected option best meets the educational needs of the District, allows the successful middle school program to continue in the current middle school facility, results in an upgraded high school facility that addresses the deficiencies identified in the Statement of Interest, has a lower initial cost, and allows for favorable construction separation and phasing.

On May 2, 2012, the District and its consultants presented the advantages and disadvantages of each of the options to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”). The FAS requested further explanation about how the District’s preferred solution compared to the District’s original desire for a middle/high school. The District explained that, after analyzing each of the options, it concluded that the District’s educational goal to provide a strong middle school identity could not be fully realized through an addition/renovation project at the existing high school. In addition, the existing middle school, constructed in 2003, currently serves the middle school population of the District successfully and does not lend itself well to an economical reconfiguration in order to serve an elementary school population. This, along with a comparative analysis of the costs of the three-school versus four-school solution, led the District to support Option 6B.1, with a 9-12 grade configuration, as its preferred solution.

As requested at the FAS, the District supplemented the educational program submitted as part of the Preferred Schematic Report to present more clearly the educational priorities that resulted in the District’s decision to limit the scope of the project to maintaining a grades 9-12 configuration. The District provided additional information that presents anticipated long-term capital and operational costs associated with both the District’s original three-school Master Plan and its preferred four-school Master Plan.

| Option | Operating Costs | Square Footage | Construction Cost* | Project Cost |
|---|------------------------|-----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------|
| Three-School Solution | \$1.57M | 409,990 | \$89.0M | \$111.6M |
| Four-School Solution (Option 1 - Code/Systems Upgrades at Lura A. White School) | \$1.62M | 427,280 | \$84.2M | \$105.6M |
| Four-School Solution (Option 2 – Addition/Renovation at Lura A. White School) | \$1.62M | 434,780 | \$94.0M | \$117.9M |

** Includes costs associated with anticipated projects at each school facility within the District*

Based on the results of this effort to better understand both the short-term and long-term implications of the proposed project, the District has concluded that limiting the current project to a high school project is in the best interest of the District both educationally and economically. Educationally, the District wanted to maintain the integrity and effectiveness of the distinct middle school and high school programs. Economically, the District was concerned with the overall cost of the middle/high school option and found that potential savings associated with operating costs for the three-school solution as opposed to the four-school solution were relatively low. Also, while current project costs and overall construction costs are estimated to be lower with the preferred grade 9-12 option, the District understands that the proposed solution to the building deficiencies in the two elementary schools within the District is not within the scope of this project and will need to be addressed by the District in a future project. Although the estimated costs for

this future work is included above, the actual cost of these future projects will be highly dependent on the scope of work that is ultimately determined necessary for the Page Hilltop School in Ayer and the Lura A. White School in Shirley.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 495 students for the Ayer Shirley Regional High School.
- 3) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 4) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.
- 5) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 6) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the schematic design phase.
- 7) The MSBA will not participate in any additional costs associated with the design, selective demolition, construction, renovation, or fit-out of the additional area of existing auditorium space and below stage storage space that is beyond MSBA guidelines, and all additional costs will be the full responsibility of the District and shall not be eligible for reimbursement.
- 8) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs. Costs associated with proposed work in auditorium space above guidelines may be ineligible for reimbursement.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Ayer Shirley Regional School District be approved to proceed into schematic design for an addition and renovation project at the Ayer Shirley Regional High School.