

District: Town of Georgetown
 School Name: Penn Brook Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: May 30, 2012

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Georgetown, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Penn Brook Elementary School with a new elementary school serving grades K-6 on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing Penn Brook Elementary School on the existing site.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Georgetown
Elementary School(s)	Perley Elementary School (PK-1) Penn Brook Elementary School (2-5)
Middle/High School(s)	Georgetown Middle/High School (6-12)
Priority School Name	Penn Brook Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	2-5
Year Opened	1970
Total Square Footage	63,640
Additions	No major building additions since original construction
Acreage of Site	64 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural integrity - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Envelope - Roof - Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational programs as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2011-2012 Enrollment	474
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 440 students for grades 2-5 configuration 770 students for grades K-6 configuration 665 students for grades 1-6 configuration
Enrollment Specifics	If the Board approves the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 770 students in grades K-6.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 31, 2010
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On June 6, 2012 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on October 3, 2012
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	49.31%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Municipal Building Consultants, Inc.
Designer	Drummeay Rosane Anderson, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Penn Brook Elementary School is a 63,640 square-foot facility located on a 64-acre site bounded by residential property, State reservation land, and wooded, rocky terrain. The existing facility serves the District's grade 2-5 student population.

The original facility was built in 1970 and has had no major additions or significant renovations since that time. The roofing material was replaced in 1997 with a fully-adhered membrane. The existing structure consists of a combination of masonry and steel with cast-in-place foundations. The sloped and gable roofing system is mainly supported by large glue-laminated wood beams. Currently, there is no apparent distress or settlement at the foundations; however, the existing block veneer has significant problems of cracking caused by thermal movement, lack of control joints, and moisture infiltration.

The existing HVAC, plumbing, and electrical systems are, for the most part, original to the building, beyond their useful life, and in need of complete replacement. Fresh air intakes serving the classrooms are close to the ground, which is problematic during the winter months when snow obstructs the vents. It is unlikely that the capacity of the existing electrical system could support major mechanical upgrades. Generally, the existing lighting is poor and should be upgraded. Emergency lighting utilizes battery back-up, and no emergency generator exists. General power is limited in classrooms and no fire suppression systems exist.

In general, the majority of the existing spaces, including academic classrooms, are undersized compared to MSBA guidelines, and this reportedly affects the District's ability to deliver its educational programs. The existing facility cannot accommodate the District's desired grade configuration, which includes increasing the student population at this facility by nearly 300 students. Additionally, handicapped accessibility is extremely limited, and the majority of the existing facility does not meet current accessibility requirements.

The District and its consultants performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the existing educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The District and its consultants initially studied 18 preliminary options: two no-build, deferred maintenance and code upgrade options; one renovation only option; three

addition/renovation options; and, 12 new construction options. The new construction options involved various building layouts and grade configurations.

These options were further evaluated and scored based on various issues related to cost, disruption to students, educational program fit, grade configuration, and site amenities. Based on these factors, the District narrowed its options to five, including two options designed to serve grades K-6, two options designed for grades 1-6, and one option designed for grades 2-5. The District also determined that a project that included only capital maintenance repairs and code upgrades would not address educational issues; therefore, the study focused on addition/ renovation and new construction options.

Based upon further review of its educational objectives, the District endorsed a grade reconfiguration for grades K-6 for the proposed project. The District determined that this grade configuration was not only the best for the development of its students at the Perley Elementary School and the Penn Brook Elementary School but also addressed the overcrowding at the Georgetown Middle/High School. Accordingly, the District and its consultants selected three alternatives for further refinement and the development of more detailed costs estimates. Table 1 presents a summary of the options considered in the final evaluation of alternatives and the associated preliminary design pricing for each option.

Table 1 – Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing Table

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction (cost/sf)**	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option D.2.2: K-6 full renovation plus large addition	97,956	63,640 \$236/sf	34,316 \$287/sf	\$1,530,532	\$26,393,884 \$269/sf	\$36,475,607
Option F.2.3: K-6 new construction on fields	98,000	N/A	98,000 \$299/sf	\$5,105,305	\$34,444,799 \$351/sf	\$45,265,669
<i>Option F.4.3: K-6 new construction in woods***</i>	<i>98,000</i>	<i>N/A</i>	<i>98,000 \$299/sf</i>	<i>\$7,048,731</i>	<i>\$36,388,225 \$371/sf</i>	<i>\$47,715,358</i>

* *Marked up construction costs*

** *Does not include construction contingency*

*** ***District's preferred option***

Although the preferred option is the most costly of the options evaluated, due mainly to the level of site development required in the selected location, the District selected this option as its preferred option because it provides distinct advantages, including adequately sized and appropriately located educational spaces for the District's desired grade configuration, avoidance

of phased renovation and disruption to existing programs during construction, and a long-term solution to the traffic capacity issues and safety concerns associated with the existing conditions.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on January 11, 2012. At that meeting, members of the FAS inquired about the District’s maintenance practices, proposed grade reconfiguration, and the impact of this project on the other schools. The FAS questioned the District’s proposal to relocate several of the Middle/High School special education programs to the Perley School in order to address overcrowding at the Middle/High School

On January 19, 2012, MSBA staff visited Georgetown to observe capacity and maintenance issues as well as the overall general conditions at the Middle/High School, the Perley School, and the Penn Brook School. Based on the MSBA’s visit, it was subsequently determined that additional work was required to further evaluate how existing programmatic and space issues would be resolved for grades K-12 if a new K-6 elementary school were to be constructed. The MSBA suggested that the District not only re-evaluate the preferred K-6 new building option but also evaluate whether options that considered a K-7 or K-8 grade configuration would be needed to properly address overcrowding at the Middle/High School. The MSBA also suggested that the District create a detailed improvement plan to address ongoing maintenance needs, focusing on the existing site drainage and water infiltration conditions at the Middle/High School and the Perley School.

On April 11, 2012, the District and its consultants presented to the FAS an overview of the additional work conducted. The District presented its analysis of deficient educational spaces at the Middle/High School and its proposal to provide more appropriately sized classrooms and more appropriate educational adjacencies by using existing space that would be vacated by the 6th grade and combining relocated spaces with recommended improvements to the facility. Although the District’s recommendation still includes relocating district-wide special education offices to the Perley Elementary School, all special education programs supporting grades 7–12 will remain in the Middle/High School. In addition, the District included a list of the facility deficiencies and estimated costs of improvements that would be required at the Middle/High School and the Perley School. The District also presented a revised layout of the Penn Brook Elementary School that would better support its educational program as well as its reasons for the proposed location of the facility on the site. The FAS inquired about the flexibility of the revised Penn Brook Elementary School layout, educational adjacencies, the number of classrooms, and the proposed location on the site.

MSBA has reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope and the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate. MSBA staff believes that the proposed grade reconfiguration for grades K-6 that will affect the existing Middle/High School and the existing Perley School will position the District to be able to address current deficiencies. The MSBA’s approval for the District to proceed into schematic design for the replacement of the Penn Brook Elementary is contingent upon the District’s commitment to address issues identified at the existing Middle/High School and Perley School. The MSBA further concludes that:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment certification.

- 2) The MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and provided the District with a Study Enrollment Certification that included the following configurations: 440 (2-5) 770 (K-6) 665 (1-6). Contingent upon the Board's approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a final Design Enrollment Certification for 770 students in grades K-6.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for the MSBA's review.
- 4) To demonstrate the District's commitment to address issues identified at the existing Middle/High School and Perley Elementary School, the District and its consultants must submit the following as a supplement to the schematic design submittal:
 - a. Georgetown's commitment and plan of action to resolve the issues identified at the Middle/High School and the Perley School. The MSBA requires a detailed written narrative of specific issues, including associated estimated costs and identification of the committees responsible for obtaining funding for improvements. The schematic design supplement must clearly document the anticipated schedule for funding, the source of funding, and actions and procurements that may be necessary to implement the proposed plan of action to address outstanding issues at the Middle/High School and Perley School.
 - b. Further site investigation, including estimated costs that will be required at the existing Middle/High School and Perley School to fully understand the existing site drainage and water infiltration issues. The schematic design supplement must identify required work, indicate estimated costs, and include a schedule that details funding, procurements, and implementation of the work.
 - c. Middle/High School Interior Space Adjustments: The District's proposed interior space adjustments must be submitted in a format acceptable to the MSBA and will be reviewed in conjunction with the District's proposed education plan and plan of action for improvements.
- 5) The District has asked if the MSBA would participate in costs associated with interior renovations at the Middle/High School associated with relocation of the 6th grade students and other capital maintenance projects that have been identified to address current deficiencies with this facility and at the Perley Elementary School. MSBA staff will work with the District and its consultants during the schematic design phase to better define the work at both schools and to determine what may or may not be considered eligible to be included within the project scope and budget agreement for the Penn Brook School or a separate project scope and budget agreement, subject to the approval of the MSBA's Board.
- 6) The District acknowledges that the site costs associated with the preferred solution are higher than the site costs for other options considered and that all site costs in excess of 8% of estimated construction costs will not be eligible for reimbursement by the MSBA. The District is solely responsible for site costs that exceed 8% of construction costs.
- 7) Should the MSBA and the District be unable to resolve outstanding issues associated with the proposed project as described above, the MSBA reserves its right to rescind its

approval for the Town of Georgetown to proceed into schematic design for replacement of the existing Penn Brook Elementary School.

Based on the review outlined above and subject to the above-described conditions, staff recommends that the Town of Georgetown be approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Penn Brook Elementary School with a new elementary school serving grades K-6 on the existing site.