

District: City of Gloucester  
 School Name: West Parish Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: September 25, 2013

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Gloucester, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing West Parish Elementary School on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing West Parish Elementary School on the existing site.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	City of Gloucester
Elementary Schools	Gloucester Preschool at the Milton L. Fuller Elementary School (PK) Beeman Memorial Elementary School (K-5) East Gloucester Elementary School (K-5) Plum Cove Elementary School (K-5) Veterans Memorial Elementary School (K-5) West Parish Elementary School (K-5)
Middle School	Ralph B. O’Maley Middle School (6-8)
High School	Gloucester High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	West Parish Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-5
Year Opened	1949
Existing Square Footage	41,420
Additions	There have been two additions to the original West Parish building: a 3,500 square foot addition in 1995 and a modular classroom added in 2008.
Acreage of Site	20 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Structural integrity</li> <li>– Mechanical systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Plumbing systems</li> <li>– Windows</li> <li>– Roof</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program and is currently overcrowded.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2012-2013 Enrollment	356
Agreed Upon Enrollment	355
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 355 students serving grades K-5.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	July 25, 2012
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On October 2, 2013 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on January 29, 2014
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	48.27%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager	Knight, Bagge, and Anderson, Inc.
Designer	Dore & Whittier Architects, Inc.

## **Discussion**

The existing West Parish Elementary School is a 41,420 square foot building on a 20 acre site in the West Parish section of Gloucester. The original building was constructed in 1949 with a classroom wing added in 1951. The single story structure consists of mostly wood planking which spans wood joists that are supported by steel pipe columns and interior masonry walls. Residential grade additions were made to the building in the 1990's that currently house the library and several classrooms. The existing facility currently houses grades K-5.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in its Statement of Interest ("SOI"). In the SOI, the District reported that, in addition to the general lack of accessibility features, the existing facility requires heating, ventilation, and electrical systems replacement, accessible plumbing fixtures, abatement of hazardous material, fire protection, as well as non-structural exterior improvements.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the Educational Program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The comprehensive assessment confirmed the deficiencies stated in the SOI. The assessment also found that a significant portion of the building is constructed with structural wood and steel members that are undersized for the current loading and seismic requirements, and that any renovation of the building would require the replacement of the entire structural system to meet current building codes.

The District considered student assignments within the District, potential opportunities for tuition agreements with adjacent districts, the use of existing educational space through leasing or acquisition, and the use of existing town-owned facilities. The District determined that none of these options are viable due to the age, locations, and inadequacies of the existing buildings.

Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied 10 preliminary options that included one base repair option, one addition/renovation configuration for the existing school, two addition/renovation configurations for the Fuller school, and six new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
	No-build base repair and code upgrade of existing facility
A	Addition/renovation of existing facility
F	Addition/renovation of Fuller School (2 schemes)
B,C,D,E,H	New construction on existing site at playfields, demolition of existing facility (5 schemes)
G	New construction on existing site at existing building, demolition of existing facility

The “No-build” base repair option was not considered a viable option as it does not address issues associated with the Educational Program. Based on the preliminary evaluation of alternatives, MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options at the current West Parish Elementary Site for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing. The four options are presented below.

- The District explored addition/renovation schemes at the Fuller School, a 181,600 square foot parochial high school that was built in 1965 and later purchased by the District and is currently serving PK students, and advanced one option, “Option F2,” for further development and consideration in the final evaluation of alternatives.
- The District advanced two new construction options, “Options G and H,” for further development and consideration in the final evaluation of alternatives as they best meet the needs of the Educational Program and District’s goals for a proposed project.
- The District advanced an addition/renovation option at the West Parish Elementary School, “Option A,” for further development and consideration in the final evaluation of alternatives.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option A: (Add/Reno West Parish School)	64,380	17,000 \$383/sf	47,380 \$405/sf	\$6,202,611	\$31,922,179 \$495/sf	\$41,141,343
Option F2: (Add/Reno Fuller School)	161,200	161,200 \$246/sf	n/a	\$5,773,858	\$45,437,444 \$282/sf	\$56,650,790
<b>Option G-4.1: (New School on Existing West Parish School Building Site)***</b>	<b>65,469</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>65,469 \$365/sf</b>	<b>\$6,389,806</b>	<b>\$30,272,866 \$462/sf</b>	<b>\$39,849,587</b>
Option H: (New School on Existing West Parish School Playfields)	66,700	n/a	66,700 \$369/sf	\$6,582,420	\$31,174,246 \$467/sf	\$40,867,656

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District’s preferred solution

The District has selected “Option G-4.1,” which replaces the existing West Parish Elementary School with a new school on the existing West Parish Elementary School building site, as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected new construction as its preferred alternative because it meets the needs of the Educational Program, addresses the deficiencies of the current facility, and is more cost-effective than the addition/renovation schemes. Further, the District selected “Option G-4.1” over “Option H” as its preferred alternative because it avoids undesirable soil conditions and minimizes the impact to onsite wetlands.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (the “FAS”) on August 28, 2013. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised concerns regarding the location of OT/PT Special Education space in relation to other educational spaces, and the distance of handicapped parking and drop-off zones from the building entrances. The FAS and MSBA staff also inquired about the District’s technology goals and the need for a dedicated computer lab, the level of technology staffing, and the District’s Educational Program regarding in-class science integration and exploration of outdoor science opportunities.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 355 students for the West Parish Elementary School.
- 2) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 4) The District’s schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Gloucester be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing West Parish Elementary School on the existing site.