

District: Town of Swampscott  
 School Name: Hadley Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: November 13, 2013

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Swampscott, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to consolidate the existing Hadley Elementary School, Clarke Elementary School, and Stanley Elementary School into a new elementary school serving grades 1-4, adjacent to the existing Swampscott Middle School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing Hadley Elementary School on the existing Swampscott Middle School site.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Swampscott
Elementary School(s)	Clarke Elementary School (K-4) Hadley Elementary School (K-4) Stanley Elementary School (K-4) Machon Elementary School (currently offline)
Middle School(s)	Swampscott Middle School (PK, 5-8)
High School(s)	Swampscott High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Hadley Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-4
Year Opened	1911
Existing Square Footage	46,600
Additions	Annex built in 1925
Acreage of Site	1.4 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Structural integrity</li> <li>- Mechanical systems</li> <li>- Electrical systems</li> <li>- Plumbing systems</li> <li>- Envelope</li> <li>- Windows</li> <li>- Roof</li> <li>- Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its special educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2012-2013 Enrollment	290
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 635 (1-4 consolidation option) 275 (K-4 single school option)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 635 students in grades 1-4.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 25, 2012
Invitation to Feasibility Study	November 14, 2012
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On November 20, 2013 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on March 26, 2014
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	45.32%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager	Collaborative Partners
Designer	Mount Vernon Group Architects

## **Discussion**

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA agreed with the District's request to explore options that included consolidation of the District's grade 1-4 student population resulting in two study design enrollments: 275 students for grades K-4 (single school option) and 635 students for grades 1-4 (consolidation option). The study included the evaluation of the District's four existing elementary schools: the Hadley Elementary School, the Stanley Elementary School, the Clarke Elementary School, and the currently offline Machon Elementary School.

The existing Hadley Elementary School is a 46,600 square foot building on a 1.4 acre site and is one of three elementary schools in the District to serve grades K-4. The original Hadley school building was constructed in 1911, and a three-story addition was completed in 1925. The District identified numerous deficiencies in its Statement of Interest ("SOI"). In the SOI, the District reported that, in addition to the general lack of accessibility features, the existing facility requires heating, ventilation and electrical systems replacement, accessible plumbing fixtures, abatement of hazardous material, fire protection, and non-structural exterior improvements.

The existing Stanley Elementary School is a 40,000 square foot building which serves grades K-4. The original Stanley School building was constructed in 1929, and a three-story addition was completed in 1952. While the building plan is extremely efficient, with central double loaded corridors, the District's feasibility study evaluation of the building found that the building's age and orientation render it functionally obsolete from an educational perspective.

The existing Clarke Elementary School is a 28,000 square foot building which serves grades K-4. The Clarke School building was constructed in 1952. The District's feasibility study evaluation of the building found that it is in fair condition and slightly undersized for its current population.

The currently offline Machon Elementary School is a 28,000 square foot building which was constructed in 1929, with a single-story addition completed in 1963. At an acre in size, the majority of the site is occupied by the building. The District's feasibility study evaluation of the building found major signs of water infiltration and that all building systems would need to be replaced.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed an assessment of the educational program, evaluated the existing conditions at all four elementary schools, and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The assessment confirmed the deficiencies stated in the SOI. In addition, the assessment found that significant water infiltration issues have caused the Hadley Elementary School building’s exterior envelope to deteriorate, and that any renovation to the building would require upgrading the structural system to meet current building codes. Based on the findings of the assessment, the District and its consultants initially studied nine preliminary options that included four addition/renovation configurations and four new construction options as presented below:

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
A	Minimal addition/renovation to the off-line Machon Elementary School (K-4)
B	Minimal addition/renovation to the Hadley Elementary School (K-4)
C	Minimal addition/renovation to the Stanley Elementary School (K-4)
D	Enhanced addition/renovation to the Stanley Elementary School (K-4)
E	New two-story building at Stanley School site (K-4)
F	New two-story building at Stanley School site (1-4)
G	New four-story building at Stanley School site (1-4)
H	New four-story building adjacent to the Swampscott Middle School (1-4)
I	No-build baseline repair of the existing Hadley Elementary School (K-4)

The no-build baseline repair, “Option I,” was not considered a viable option as it does not address all of the issues associated with the existing building and the District’s educational program. The minimal addition/renovations at the off-line Machon Elementary School and at the Hadley Elementary School, “Options A and B,” were not considered for further evaluation because the District’s desired programmatic goals could not be achieved due to site constraints. The addition/renovations options for the existing Stanley Elementary School, “Options C and D,” were not considered for further evaluation because they did not address the District’s desired programmatic goals and the deficiencies identified in the SOI for the Hadley School. The District determined that to keep in line with its stated goal of providing educational parity across the District, and due to conditions at the four existing elementary schools, “Options A, B, C, D, E and I,” featuring a design enrollment of 275 students in grades K-4, do not provide the most educationally responsible solution for the District, nor do they address the deficiencies identified at the existing buildings.

Based upon further review of its educational objectives, the District endorsed a grade reconfiguration and consolidation of grades 1-4 for the proposed project. The District determined that this grade configuration is the best option for the development of its students in grades 1-4. The District also determined that this grade configuration addresses current overcrowding at the Swampscott Middle School by moving Pre-K students to the Clarke School, forming an early education center with Kindergarten students. Accordingly, the District proceeded with three final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below:

### Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option F: (New 2-Story School at Stanley Site)	100,000	-	100,000	\$5,396,726	\$35,155,864	\$41,406,950
		-	\$351.56/sf		\$351.51//sf	
Option G: (New 4-Story School at Stanley Site)	100,283	-	100,283	\$5,395,355	\$32,934,960	\$39,872,650
		-	\$328.42/sf		\$328.11/sf	
<b>Option H: (New 4-Story School at Middle School Site)***</b>	<b>99,488</b>	-	<b>99,488</b>	<b>\$5,396,988</b>	<b>\$33,074,223</b>	<b>\$40,062,900</b>
		-	<b>\$332.44/sf</b>		<b>\$332.44/sf</b>	

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District's preferred option

The District has selected “Option H,” a new four-story school at the Swampscott Middle School site, as the preferred alternative to proceed into schematic design. The District selected “Option H” as its preferred alternative because it addresses the District’s educational goals in an efficient and cost-effective manner, while achieving educational equity for Swampscott’s elementary school children across the District. The District has noted that although the Stanley School site may be larger than the Middle School site, improved site circulation, less impact of construction on students and abutters, and the educational opportunities offered by a new Elementary School adjacent to the Middle School contributed to “Option H” being selected as the District’s preferred option.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on October 23, 2013, focusing on the District’s educational program and the final evaluation of options. The District elaborated on the significant parking and traffic concerns of the Stanley School site, indicating that the site currently had only one access point and any potential project at the site would be limited in its ability to provide ample parking, safe and efficient circulation, and provide adequate queue space for drop off and pick up. The District also stated the educational benefits of having the elementary school adjacent to the middle school. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised concerns about the following items: 1) isolation of STEM and Computer Lab spaces; 2) absence of collaboration spaces; 3) creating an environment that is suitable for elementary-aged students; 4) density and circulation on the site; and 5) abutters. The MSBA required the District and design team to provide a supplement to address these issues. In response, the District revised the proposed floor plans (1) to present a layout that is appropriate for elementary school students and (2) to remove dedicated computer lab spaces and provide integrated technology in new break-out spaces placed on each floor of the building. The District also provided narratives addressing the site concerns raised at the FAS, indicating that some site issues associated with the preferred option were inevitable and have been mitigated to the extent possible.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) MSBA previously completed a study enrollment projection and reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 275 students for a K-4 facility or 635 students for a consolidated 1-4 facility. Based on the District's preferred solution, the District will be required to execute a final Design Enrollment Certification indicating acceptance of a 635-student enrollment serving grades 1-4. A Design Enrollment Certification will be provided by the MSBA for District signature.
- 2) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review. However, the submitted budget statement provided information regarding only the Hadley Elementary School. As the District's preferred option is a district-wide solution, the District will submit, as a part of their schematic design submittal, an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review that addresses all schools affected by the proposed project.
- 4) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval of the proposed project, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) The District has provided a proposed space summary which has a grossing factor of 1.52, which exceeds 1.5 the limit for which the MSBA will reimburse for eligible construction costs. As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Swampscott be approved to proceed into schematic design to consolidate the existing Hadley Elementary School, Clarke Elementary School, and Stanley Elementary School into a new elementary school serving grades 1-4, adjacent to the existing Swampscott Middle School.