

District: City of Lynn  
 School Name: Thurgood Marshall Middle School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: March 27, 2013

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Lynn, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Thurgood Marshall Middle School with the construction of a new facility for grades 6-8, to be located at the Brookline Street site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing Thurgood Marshall Middle School with the construction of a new Thurgood Marshall Middle School at the Brookline Street site, contingent upon the City obtaining full ownership, control, and use of the site.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	City of Lynn
Elementary School(s)	7 (PK-5) 1 (PK-6) 10 (K-5)
Middle School(s)	Breed Middle School (6-8) Pickering Middle School (6-8) Thurgood Marshall Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Fecteau-Leary Junior-Senior High School (7-12) Classical High School (9-12) Lynn English High (9-12) Lynn Vocational Technical Institute (PK, 9-12)
Priority School Name	Thurgood Marshall Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	6-8
Year Opened	1923
Existing Square Footage	150,466
Additions	1929, 1963
Acreage of Site	3.5 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Structural integrity</li> <li>- Mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems</li> <li>- Envelope and windows</li> <li>- Roofing</li> <li>- Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2012-2013 Enrollment	973 Students
Agreed Upon Enrollment	1,100
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 1,100 students serving grades 6-8.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 31, 2010
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 3, 2013 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on October 2, 2013
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	80%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager	Joslin Lesser + Associates, Inc.
Designer	Raymond Design Associates, Inc.

## **Discussion**

The existing Thurgood Marshall Middle School is a 150,466 gross square foot masonry and steel structure that opened in 1923 with additions in 1929 and 1963. The existing facility is located on a 3.5-acre densely populated urban site and currently houses middle school students for grades 6-8.

The District identified and the Feasibility Study confirmed numerous deficiencies in the following areas: structural integrity; mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope and windows; roofing; and accessibility. In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied seven preliminary options that included one baseline repair option, one addition/renovation option, and five new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
	No-build base repair and code upgrade of existing facility
1	Addition/renovation of existing facility
2	New construction on existing site, demolition of existing facility (2 schemes)
3	New construction at Brookline Street site (2 schemes)
4	New construction at Keany Park site (3 schemes)
5	New construction at Kiley Field site
6	New construction at Clark Field site

The "No-build" base repair option was not considered a viable option as it does not address issues associated with the existing building and educational program. The new construction schemes associated with "Options 5 and 6" were not considered for further evaluation as these alternative sites were considered the least advantageous when compared to the existing and Brookline Street site.

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Feet</b>	<b>Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)</b>	<b>Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)</b>	<b>Site, Building Takedown, Haz. Mat. Cost*</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction** (cost*/sf)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Project Costs</b>
Option 1A: (Renovation/Addition to Existing School)	193,048	126,031 \$274/sf	67,017 \$345/sf	\$4,792,893	\$62,449,173 \$324/sf	\$83,826,114
Option 2C: (New Construction on Existing Site)	181,847	n/a	181,847 \$343/sf	\$5,959,198	\$68,395,206 \$376/sf	\$91,503,930
<b>Option 3A: (New Construction on Brookline Street)***</b>	<b>181,847</b>	<i>n/a</i>	<i>181,847</i> <i>\$336/sf</i>	<i>\$2,924,482</i>	<i>\$64,076,373</i> <i>\$352/sf</i>	<i>\$83,358,654</i>
Option 4A: (New Construction at Keany Park)	181,847	n/a	181,847 \$346/sf	\$3,291,295	\$66,163,143 \$364/sf	\$89,118,065

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District's preferred option

The District has selected “Option 3A”, which replaces the existing Thurgood Marshall Middle School facility with a new four-story facility on the Brookline Street site, as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District selected “Option 3A” as its preferred solution because this option achieves the District’s desired educational goals with reduced impact to students during construction and results in the least number of property takings when compared to the other options considered. Additionally, “Option 3A” is estimated at a lower cost when compared to “Options 1A, 2C, and 4A”.

The proposed construction at the Brookline Street site requires multiple land acquisitions by the District and the District anticipates this process to be complete by October 2013. The District has acknowledged that all necessary local, state, and federal approvals for full ownership and control by the City of the proposed building site must be gained within 120 days from approval of the Project Scope and Budget by the MSBA Board of Directors; and that a Project Funding Agreement will not be executed prior to gaining these approvals.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on February 27, 2013. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised a number of concerns including: 1) land acquisition process and schedule; 2) proposed solution’s fit to the education program; 3) proposed

proximity of the building to the existing railroad tracks; 4) further evaluation of circulation through the building; and 5) future considerations for a rooftop play area. As part of the ongoing dialogue with the design team and throughout the Schematic Design Phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to address the concerns identified above.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and an executed Enrollment Certification.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 1,100 students for grades 6-8.
- 3) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 4) The District must secure full ownership, control, and use of the proposed site within 120 days of the MSBA Board of Director's approval of the project scope and budget, and any such approval will be conditional upon the District securing full ownership, control, and use of the property.
- 5) The District has acknowledged that securing full ownership, control, and use of the proposed site is a prerequisite for the execution of a Project Funding Agreement.
- 6) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 7) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to execution of a Project Funding Agreement.
- 8) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design Phase.

MSBA staff recommends that the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Lynn, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Thurgood Marshall Middle School with the construction of a new facility for grades 6-8, to be located at the Brookline Street site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's preferred solution to replace the existing Thurgood Marshall Middle School with the construction of a new Thurgood Marshall Middle School at the Brookline Street site, contingent upon the City obtaining full ownership, control, and use of the site.