

District: Town of Winthrop
 School Name: Winthrop High School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: March 27, 2013

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Winthrop, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing middle and high schools on the existing high school site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution to replace the existing Winthrop Middle and High Schools with a new 6-12 facility on the existing high school site.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Winthrop
Elementary School(s)	William P. Gorman Fort Banks Elementary (PK-2) Arthur T. Cummings Elementary School (3-5)
Middle School(s)	Winthrop Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Winthrop High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Winthrop High School
Type of School	High School
Grades Served	9-12
Year Opened	1965
Existing Square Footage	115,153
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	15.3 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - MEP/FP systems - Building envelope - Windows and doors - Roof - Accessibility - Stairs
Original Design Capacity	Approximately 585
2012-2013 Enrollment	548
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 970 students (6-12) (<i>Preferred Solution</i>) 815 students (7-12) 510 students (9-12)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 970 students in grades 6-12.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Feasibility Study for Repair	November 28, 2007
Re-classified from Repair Assessment to Feasibility Study	July 27, 2011
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 3, 2013 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on July 31, 2013
Reimbursement Rate Before Incentives	54.16%

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager	Skanska USA Buildings, Inc.
Designer	HMFH Architects, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Winthrop High School is an 115,153 square foot building on a 15.3 acre site. The facility currently houses 548 students in grades 9-12. Due to the poor condition of both the Winthrop High School and Winthrop Middle School, the MSBA and the District agreed to study options for a high school serving grades 9-12 with an agreed upon design enrollment of 510 students as well as options for a combined middle/high school facility that includes either grades 7-12 with an agreed upon design enrollment of 815 students or grades 6-12 with an agreed upon design enrollment of 970 students.

The District's Statement of Interest identified numerous deficiencies in the existing high school facility. The existing mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems are obsolete and in need of replacement. The building does not have a fire sprinkler system or adequate water pressure. The masonry and concrete building envelope is deteriorating and lacks thermal insulation. The roof, windows, and doors are in need of replacement. Both the site and the building present accessibility challenges. The existing Winthrop Middle School was originally built in 1955 as a community gym and auditorium, and was later converted to a middle school with a 1970s classroom addition. The existing conditions report noted that, in addition to the deficiencies listed above for the high school, the existing middle school has stairs that are not compliant with the current code, ceilings that are lower than allowed by the current building code, severe water damage in the basement, and many classrooms with no access to natural daylight.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program at both schools and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The District's initial work noted that the site of the middle school is too small to accommodate a new high school or new middle/high school facility. In addition, the District and its consultants performed a space utilization study of the District's two elementary schools to further inform the optimum grade configuration for the proposed project. This study indicated that relocating the 6th grade from the middle school to the elementary schools would require building an addition to one of the existing elementary schools, since both schools are currently near capacity. For this reason, the 7-12 grade configuration was

not included in the list of Preliminary Options. Based on the findings of the District’s assessment, the District and its consultants initially studied six preliminary options that included a repair option, two configurations for an addition/renovation of the high school, and three new construction options, as described below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
1	Base repair of the existing middle and high schools
A	Addition/renovation to the existing high school building to construct a 6-12 MS/HS
B	New 6-12 middle/high school on the existing HS foundation
C	Addition/renovation to the existing high school building to construct a 9-12 HS
D	New 6-12 middle/high school on the existing fields portion of the HS site
E	New 9-12 high school on the existing fields portion of the HS site

The District’s review estimated that a base repair of both the middle and the high school would cost approximately \$50 million and would not adequately address the educational needs in these facilities. Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed on three final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option A: (Add/reno 6-12 MS/HS)	171,000	115,153 \$283/sf	55,847 \$340/sf	\$8,559,352	\$60,164,737 \$352/sf	\$72,197,684
Option B: (New 6-12 MS/HS) ***	184,000	\$0 NA	184,000 \$321/sf	\$10,243,571	\$69,105,031 \$376/sf	\$82,926,037
Option C: (Add/reno 9-12 HS)	130,153	115,153 \$289/sf	15,000 \$393/sf	\$8,559,352	\$47,678,809 \$366/sf	\$57,214,571

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

***District’s preferred option

The District has selected Option B, a new 6-12 middle/high school on the existing high school site, as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. Although Option A, an addition/renovation for grades 6-12 was less expensive, this option did not effectively meet the needs of the District’s educational program. The existing facility has a large number of undersized existing classrooms that cannot be addressed in the renovation option. The existing facility also has a low floor to floor dimension, which limits the options for replacement of the mechanical systems. Option B, a new facility for grades 6-12, is three stories and more compact. Option B maintains the current play fields, allows for future expansion on the site, and provides the advantage of reduced operational costs and efficiencies resulting from a combined middle/high

school facility. Option B also meets the District's goals of providing full separation between middle and high school students and a clear delineation between the three middle school grades.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on March 20, 2013. At that meeting, members of the FAS made the following observations regarding the preliminary plan configuration, with the understanding that the design team will work with the District and the MSBA to further develop the plan and address the following comments early in the schematic design phase of the proposed:

- 1) Consider reconfiguration of the service entrance location and connection to the kitchen area;
- 2) Evaluate the option to stack or to distribute the science labs throughout the high school classroom areas;
- 3) Confirm that adequate acoustical separation between the auditorium and gym floors can be provided;
- 4) Review alternative staff access and circulation pathways between the high school and middle school portions of the facility;
- 5) Consider providing a more central location of the elevators to better serve both high school and middle school students; and
- 6) Evaluate the distribution, size and location of the special education rooms throughout the facility.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA has completed an enrollment projection and has reached a mutual agreement with the District for a design enrollment of 970 students for a 6-12 school.
- 3) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 4) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 5) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to execution of a Project Funding Agreement.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to better understand the total area associated with health and physical education and how the space serves the student population.

- 7) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Winthrop be approved to proceed into schematic design to replace the existing Winthrop Middle and High Schools with a new 6-12 facility on the existing high school site.