District: City of Woburn
School Name: Wyman Elementary School
Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
Date: November 12, 2014

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Woburn, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Wyman Elementary School and the existing Daniel P. Hurld Elementary School with a new K-5 facility on an alternative site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's preferred solution.

| **District Information** | |
|---|---|
| District Name | City of Woburn |
| Elementary School(s) | Clyde Reeves Elementary School (PK-5)<br>Shamrock Elementary School (PK-5)<br>Daniel P. Hurld Elementary School (K-5)<br>Goodyear Elementary School (K-5)<br>Linscott-Rumford Elementary School (K-5)<br>Malcolm White Elementary School (K-5)<br>Mary D. Altavesta Elementary School (K-5)<br>Wyman Elementary School (K-5) |
| Middle School(s) | Daniel L. Joyce Middle School (6-8)<br>John F. Kennedy Middle School (6-8) |
| High School(s) | Woburn High School (9-12) |
| Priority School Name | Wyman Elementary School |
| Type of School | Elementary School |
| Grades Served | K-5 |
| Year Opened | 1892 |
| Existing Square Footage | 35,436 |
| Additions | 1920: four classroom addition<br>1962: addition |
| Acreage of Site | 3.6 acres |
| Building Issues | The District identified deficiencies in the following areas:<br>– Mechanical systems<br>– Electrical systems<br>– Plumbing systems<br>– Roof<br>– Accessibility<br>In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program. |
| Original Design Capacity | Unknown |
| 2013-2014 Enrollment | 186 |

| | |
|---|---|
| Agreed Upon Enrollment | Study Enrollment includes the following configurations:<br>210 students (grade configuration K-5)<br>410 students (combine two schools with a K-5 grade configuration) *(Preferred Solution)* |
| Enrollment Specifics | Contingent upon the Board's approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 410 students in grades K-5. |

| **MSBA Board Votes** | |
|---|---|
| Invitation to Eligibility Period | November 14, 2012 |
| Invitation to Feasibility Study | July 31, 2013 |
| Preferred Schematic Authorization | On November 19, 2014 Board agenda |
| Project Scope & Budget Authorization | District is targeting Board authorization on March 25, 2015 |
| Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable) | 50.58% |

| **Consultants** | |
|---|---|
| Owner's Project Manager | Municipal Building Consultants, Inc. |
| Designer | DiNisco Design Partnership, Ltd. |

**Discussion**

As part of the Feasibility Study, the Massachusetts School Building Authority ("MSBA") agreed with the District's request to explore options including consolidation of the Wyman Elementary School and the Daniel P. Hurld Elementary School with an MSBA Study Enrollment of 410 students serving Grades K-5. The District also studied options for the Wyman Elementary School only with an MSBA Study Enrollment of 210 students. The study performed by the District and its consultants included the evaluation of both the Wyman Elementary School and the Daniel P. Hurld Elementary School.

The District identified an overall goal to reduce the number of elementary schools from nine to six. The District has already combined the Goodyear Elementary and the Clapp Elementary Schools. In the Wyman Elementary School Statement of Interest ("SOI"), the District identified a goal of this project would be to build a facility that would house students from both the Wyman Elementary and Hurld Elementary Schools.

The existing Wyman Elementary School is a 35,436 square foot facility serving Grades K-5 located on 3.6 acres. The original four-classroom Romanesque Revival style building was constructed in 1892, with a four classroom addition constructed in 1924 and another addition constructed in 1962. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the SOI, including inefficient and antiquated mechanical systems which have exceeded their maximum serviceable life, an electrical system which is at capacity that inhibits development of programming, lack of fire sprinklers, and inadequate accessibility.

The existing Daniel P. Hurld Elementary School is a 28,771 square foot facility serving Grades K-5 located on 11.3 acres, of which only 4.6 acres are deemed usable with the balance of the site classified as wetlands. The school was constructed in 1956 and there have been no additions. A 2012 SOI for the Hurld School notes the building operates with one steam boiler which has

exceeded its maximum serviceable life and provides uneven heat. The District also noted issues with the mechanical system and original pneumatic controls, insufficient ventilation, old and insufficient electrical switchboard, no fire sprinkler system, insufficient smoke detectors, and inadequate accessibility.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program, receiving input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied seven preliminary options that included one base repair option, two addition/renovation configurations, and four new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered.

| Option | Description of Preliminary Options |
|---|---|
| 0 | No Build Option – Wyman Elementary School |
| 1 | Addition/Renovation – Wyman Elementary School (210 students) |
| 2 | New Construction – Wyman Elementary School at Wyman School Site (210 students) |
| 3 | Addition/Renovation – Hurld School Site (410 students) |
| 4 | New Construction – Hurld School Site (410 students) |
| 5 | New Construction – 41 Wyman Street Site (410 students) |
| 6 | New Construction – 71 Wyman Street Site (410 students) |

The District investigated and found the Wyman Elementary School site with its limited area to be insufficient for a facility that would conform to MSBA guidelines. This finding eliminated the No-Build "Option 0 (base repair)," "Option 1– Addition/Renovation," and "Option 2 – New Construction" from further consideration in the Final Evaluation of Alternatives. The District met with the owners of the property at 71 Wyman Street who stated their intention to retain the property, and therefore, "Option 6" was also eliminated from further consideration. The District advanced the remaining three options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation. Preliminary design pricing for each of the Options included in the Final Evaluation of Alternatives is presented below.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

| Option (Description) | Total Gross Square Feet | Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf) | Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf) | Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost* | Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf) | Estimated Total Project Costs |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Option 3: Add/Reno Hurld School Site (410 students) | 72,111 | 11,686<br>$340.12/sf | 60,425<br>$304.25/sf | $4,204,684 | $26,563,632<br>$368.37/sf | $33,904,441 |
| Option 4: New Construction Hurld School Site (410 students) | 70,703 | N/A | 70,703<br>$303.96/sf | $4,490,353 | $25,981,236<br>$367.47/sf | $33,176,203 |
| ***Option 5: New Construction 41 Wyman St Site (410 students) ****** | ***70,701*** | ***N/A*** | ***70,701***<br>***$303.96/sf*** | ***$4,258,973*** | ***$25,749,248***<br>***$364.20/sf*** | ***$32,186,412*** |

** Marked up construction costs*

*** Does not include construction contingency*

******District's preferred option***

Further study of "Options 3 and 4" concluded that any development on the existing Daniel P. Hurld Elementary School site would provide minimal space for play area, vehicular access, and parking. The District has selected "Option 5 – New Construction" at 41 Wyman Street as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design because it was the most cost-effective and provided more space for play areas, site circulation, and parking.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on October 29, 2014. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised the following issues: travel distance from handicapped parking to the facility; distance from the drop off area and the main entrance; and the importance of continued development of the design to resolve existing groundwater/water-table concerns. The FAS also noted the potential benefits of reclassifying the health/science classroom as a project room and recommended considering sink installations in classrooms to better accommodate classroom science experimentation. The FAS also discussed the District's scheduling of enrichment programs and the potential for natural lighting of the proposed art classroom.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

1) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.

2) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.

3) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Woburn be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Wyman Elementary School and the existing Daniel P. Hurld Elementary School with a new K-5 facility on an alternative site.