

District: City of Beverly
 School Name: Briscoe Middle School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: March 18, 2015

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Beverly, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Briscoe Middle School and the Memorial Building (served as a middle school until 2005), with a new 5-8 facility on the existing Memorial Building site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	City of Beverly
Elementary School(s)	Cove Elementary School (PK-5) Ayers Ryal Side Elementary School (K-5) Centerville Elementary School (K-5) Hannah Elementary School (K-5) North Beverly Elementary School (K-5)
Middle School	Briscoe Middle School (6-8)
High School	Beverly High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Briscoe Middle School
Type of School	Middle School
Grades Served	6-8
Year Opened	1923
Existing Square Footage	144,349
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	8.14 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural integrity - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Envelope - Windows - Roof - Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2014-2015 Enrollment	919
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 1,395 (grades 5-8) (<i>Preferred Solution</i>) 1,040 (grades 6-8)

Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 1,395 students in grades 5-8.
----------------------	--

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	October 2, 2013
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 26, 2014
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On March 25, 2015 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on September 30, 2015
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	51.42%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager	Heery International, Inc.
Designer	Ai3 Architects, LLC

Discussion

The existing Briscoe Middle School is a 144,349 square foot building located on an eight acre site, that currently serves grades 6-8 with a current enrollment of 933. The Briscoe Middle School, built in 1923 as a high school, has operated as a middle school since 1965 with most of the original infrastructure and features still in place. The building has not undergone significant upgrades aside from routine maintenance of the brick masonry exterior, repair of masonry lintels and sills, replacement of single pane windows with inoperable double pane windows in 1995, a roof replacement in 1993, and boiler replacement in 1955. The District’s Statement of Interest (“SOI”) identified numerous deficiencies in the existing middle school including undersized classrooms, overcrowding, deficient handicap accessibility, lack of insulation and ventilation, aged building systems, insufficient parking, and limited outdoor space.

As part of the Feasibility Study, the District performed an assessment and evaluation of the Memorial building and its site as a potential solution to the deficiencies identified in the SOI. The Memorial Building is a 103,000 square foot building built in 1954 with no additions or major renovations to date. The Memorial Building served as a school until 2005 when grades 6-8 were consolidated at the Briscoe Middle School. The Feasibility Study identified numerous deficiencies in the Memorial Building including undersized classrooms, deficient handicap accessibility, lack of project and planning space, outdated building systems and an inefficient building envelope.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. The District also performed an assessment and evaluation of a possible grade reconfiguration based on the District’s desire to pursue a grade 5-8 middle school educational model. On February 26, 2014, the School Committee unanimously voted to approve pursuing a middle school Grade 5-8 configuration as part of the Feasibility Study. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied eight preliminary options that included four addition/renovation configurations and four new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
1	Construct a new 5-8 middle school on the Memorial Building site
2	Renovate and expand the existing Memorial Building for use as a 5-8 middle school
3	Construct a new 5-8 middle school on the existing Briscoe Middle School site
4	Renovate and expand the Briscoe Middle School for use as a 5-8 middle school
5	Construct a new 6-8 middle school on the Memorial Building site
6	Renovate and expand the existing Memorial Building for use as a 6-8 middle school
7	Construct a new 6-8 middle school on the existing Briscoe Middle School site
8	Renovate and expand the Briscoe Middle School for use as a 6-8 middle school

The District investigated and found the Briscoe Elementary School site with its limited area to be insufficient for a facility that would conform to MSBA guidelines. This finding eliminated the options proposed for the Briscoe Middle School site, options 3,4, 7, and 8. The District found that the Preliminary Design Program reinforced prior grade configuration analysis, and determined that in line with the District’s stated goal to pursue a grade 5-8 middle school, it would not pursue “Option 5” and “Option 6.” The District advanced the remaining two options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and included an additional “Option 2B” - a second renovation and addition option which considers re-using less of the existing Memorial Building.

In order for the District and the MSBA to understand the financial impact of including an auditorium that is to be ineligible for reimbursement in the proposed Middle School Project, the MSBA requested the District include at least one alternative that does not include an auditorium in the final evaluation of alternatives (Option 1B below).

Option	Description
1A	A new 5-8 on the Memorial Building site
1B	A new 5-8 on the Memorial Building site without an auditorium
2A	Limited addition/renovation to the existing Memorial Building for grades 5-8
2B	Extensive addition/renovation to the existing Memorial Building for grades 5-8

MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development. Preliminary design pricing for these options is presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<i>Option 1A: (new 5-8 on the Memorial Building site)***</i>	233,264	-	233,264	\$2,456,000	\$98,189,878	\$121,819,300
		-	\$410.41/sf		\$420.94/sf	
Option 1B: (new 5-8 on the Memorial Building site without an auditorium)	224,714	-	224,714	\$2,456,000	\$93,937,069	\$116,760,996
		-	\$407.71/sf		\$418.03/sf	
Option 2A: (Limited Add/reno to the existing Memorial Building for grades 5-8)	253,339	88,000	165,339	\$1,840,000	\$100,820,104	\$125,521,987
		\$356.53/sf	\$408.89/sf		\$397.97/sf	
Option 2B: (Extensive Add/reno to the existing Memorial Building for grades 5-8)	235,264	20,000	215,264	\$2,316,000	\$98,663,940	\$123,064,789
		\$532.89/sf	\$398.07/sf		\$419.38/sf	

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

****District's preferred option*

The District has selected “Option 1A” – which replaces the existing Briscoe Middle School with a new 5-8 middle school on the Memorial Building site, as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. This option represents the District’s solution to deliver its desired educational program for a four-grade middle school. The proposed solution will arrange team spaces in the District’s ideal configuration to allow for collaboration between teachers and students to facilitate project-based learning. After reviewing the costs associated with the auditorium, the District indicated that the auditorium is a vital educational and community resource which cannot be eliminated from the proposed middle school program, and therefore eliminated “Option 1B.” In addition, and based on evaluation of the existing conditions, renovation of the existing building will require full compliance with the building code for new construction resulting in the renovation/addition options, “Options 2A and 2B” having higher estimated construction costs. Additionally, it was determined that “Option 1A” could best satisfy the District’s goals of educational visioning and program, where the addition/renovation options would compromise important relationships between the various educational program elements by constraining programs to areas of the existing building footprint.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on February 25, 2015. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the proposed academic neighborhoods, professional development of faculty, afterschool programming, ineligible costs, and design considerations relating to classrooms, science labs, courtyard maintenance, handicap accessibility, security and building envelope.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The MSBA has reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the schematic design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to understand the scope of work and associated square footage in order to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate between eligible and ineligible costs. Work associated with the proposed auditorium and dental clinic will be ineligible for reimbursement.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Beverly be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Briscoe Middle School and the Memorial Building (served as a middle school until 2005), with a new 5-8 facility on the site of the existing Memorial Building.