

District: City of New Bedford  
 School Name: John Hannigan Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: March 18, 2015

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of New Bedford, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing John Hannigan Elementary School with a new PK-5 facility on the existing site, contingent upon the City obtaining full ownership, control, and use of the site.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	City of New Bedford
Elementary School(s)	John Hannigan Elementary School (1-5) Renaissance Community School for the Arts (PK-3) 9 (PK-5) 8 (K-5)
Middle School(s)	Keith Middle School (6-8) Normandin Middle School (6-8) Roosevelt Middle School (6-8)
Middle/High School(s)	Whaling City Junior/Senior High School (6-12) Trinity Day Academy (7-12)
High School(s)	New Bedford High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	John Hannigan Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	1-5
Year Opened	1921
Existing Square Footage	48,550
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	1.5 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Structural integrity</li> <li>- Mechanical, plumbing, and electrical systems</li> <li>- Roof, windows, and building envelope</li> <li>- Accessibility and life safety</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program and lacks educationally appropriate spaces. It should be noted that due to safety concerns, the existing Hannigan building was closed in 2007.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2014-2015 Enrollment	225
Agreed Upon Enrollment	400
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 400 students for grades K-5, for a project that will serve grades PK-5.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Feasibility Study	July 29, 2009
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On March 25, 2015 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on July 29, 2015
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	79.58%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager	Daedalus Projects, Inc.
Designer	T2 Architecture, Inc.

## Discussion

The existing John Hannigan Elementary School is a 48,550 square foot building located on an urban 1.5 acre site. The original school building was constructed in 1921 and closed in 2007. No students currently attend school at this facility.

The District identified, and the Feasibility Study confirmed, numerous deficiencies in the following areas: structural integrity; mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope and windows; roofing; life safety; and accessibility. As a result of poor interior conditions that caused partial ceiling collapse, the existing building has remained closed since 2007. The District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program and that many existing spaces are undersized.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied (8) preliminary options that included (2) addition/renovation configurations and (5) new construction options and (1) base repair option. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
1	Base repair/renovation with minor addition of the existing Hannigan school
2A	Addition/renovation of the existing Hannigan school, utilizing Freeman St. for site expansion
2B	Addition/renovation of the existing Hannigan school, utilizing Freeman St. for parking and property takings along Brock Ave.
3	New construction on Church St. site
4A	New construction on existing Hannigan school site, utilizing Freeman St. for parking
4B	New construction on existing Hannigan school site, utilizing Freeman St. for parking and property takings along Brock Ave.
5	New construction on the existing Taylor School site
6	New construction on City-owned site, adjacent to hurricane barrier

As a result of further analysis, "Option 1" was not considered for further evaluation, as this option did not address all building and site deficiencies in order for the District to deliver their

educational program. “Option 2B” was also not considered for further evaluation, as it had the highest preliminary cost of all of the alternatives. In addition, although “Option 2” provided enough space to accommodate the basic needs of the education program, compromises to meeting the full educational program and desired adjacencies would be required. “Option 5” was not considered for further evaluation, as this option would involve the demolition of an existing building significant to the community, includes a number of challenging site conditions, and is not well located for equal distribution of students in the District. “Option 6” was not considered for further evaluation, as this option would require access to an easement adjacent to the existing hurricane barrier, would be susceptible to flood potential given its low-lying location, and is not well located for equal distribution of students in the District.

Upon further discussion and review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below. (Please note that the “Base Repair” option has been included for comparative purposes.)

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

Option	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/ sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/ sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz/Mat Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sf)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1: Base Repair	56,350	48,550 (\$215/sf)	7,800 (\$548/sf)	\$3,304,000	\$17,648,000 (\$295/sf)	\$21,177,600
Option 2A: Add/Reno	56,350	48,550 (\$292/sf)	7,800 (\$320/SF)	\$3,304,000	\$21,520,000 (\$380/sf)	\$25,824,000
Option 3: New Construction (Church St.)	79,303	n/a	79,303 (\$393/sf)	\$1,921,000	\$33,080,000 (\$417/sf)	\$41,696,000
Option 4A: New Construction (on existing Hannigan site)	80,250	n/a	80,250 (\$389/sf)	\$1,886,000	\$33,105,000 (\$413/sf)	\$39,700,000
<b>Option 4B*** New Construction (on expanded Hannigan site)</b>	<b>79,362</b>	<b>n/a</b>	<b>79,362 (\$387/sf)</b>	<b>\$2,225,000</b>	<b>\$33,001,000 (\$416/sf)</b>	<b>\$40,400,000</b>

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District’s preferred option

The District has selected “Option 4B”, which replaces the existing Hannigan building with a new PK-5 facility, as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. This option represents the District’s solution to deliver its desired educational program for a PK-5 elementary school within walking distance of student’s homes. The proposed solution will provide clustered grade classrooms with adjacent flexible spaces that supports the District’s “Workshop Model” of teaching. “Option 4B” also offers the greatest overall outdoor space, when compared to the other options, to be utilized for play areas, athletics, learning spaces, and community recreation.

“Option 4A” essentially provides the same building layout to deliver the District’s educational program, however, does not offer the same building presence and outdoor space as in “Option 4B.” “Option 2A” provides space to accommodate the basic needs of the District’s education program, however, desired adjacencies and areas are compromised. “Option 2B” does not offer the amount of outdoor space desired by the District. “Option 3” involves the acquisition of seven private properties, compared to four in “Option 4B,” adding significant cost to the District, as well as not providing ideal exterior adjacencies and the amount of outdoor space desired by the District.

It should be noted that the preferred solution at the existing Hannigan site requires multiple land acquisitions by the District. The MSBA has notified the District that full control, ownership, and use of the proposed building site for this option must be gained within 120 days from approval of the Project Scope and Budget by the MSBA Board of Directors; and that a Project Funding Agreement will not be executed prior to the District securing full ownership, control, and use of the proposed building site.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on February 25, 2015. At that meeting, members of the FAS raised concerns regarding previous visits to the Lincoln Elementary School and Keith Middle School regarding program delivery. The concerns raised included the apparent high student population per classroom and how this could translate to the proposed class sizes associated with the preferred solution for the Hannigan project, timing and requirements of State and local historical concern as they relate to the existing Hannigan building and other associated properties, timing associated with acquiring the additional property required as part of the District’s preferred solution and how it relates to scope, budget, and schedule, and the potential to implement the proposed educational program for Hannigan students who will remain at the Sea Lab facility until completion of the proposed Hannigan project.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) All initial paperwork required has been processed, including an executed Initial Compliance Certification, the composition of the School Building Committee, and the enrollment information.
- 2) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 4) The District’s schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal.
- 5) The District must secure full ownership, control, and use of the proposed site within 120 days of the MSBA Board of Director’s approval of the project scope and budget, and any

such approval will be conditional upon the District securing full ownership, control, and use of the property.

- 6) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 7) Throughout the course of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to understand and identify areas of improvement and/or development of the overall layout as it compares to the conceptual layout established at Preferred Schematic.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of New Bedford be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing John Hannigan Elementary School with a new PK-5 facility on the existing site, contingent upon the City obtaining full ownership, control, and use of the site.