

District: Town of Hanover  
 School Name: Sylvester Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: March 23, 2016

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Hanover, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design for a potential addition and renovation project at the Center Elementary School that will relocate students in Grades 2-4, currently attending the Cedar Elementary School and the Sylvester Elementary School, into a District-wide, Grades 2-4 school located at the existing Center Elementary School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Hanover
Elementary Schools	Cedar Elementary School (PK–4) Center Elementary School (PK–2) Sylvester Elementary School (3–4)
Middle School	Hanover Middle School (5–8)
High School	Hanover High School (9–12)
Priority School Name	Sylvester Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	3–4
Year Opened	1927
Existing Square Footage	32,377
Additions	1960
Acreage of Site	34.7 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Structural integrity</li> <li>– Mechanical systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Plumbing systems</li> <li>– Envelope</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2015-2016 Enrollment	234
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– 230 (3–4)</li> <li>– 415 (K–4)</li> <li>– 560 (district-wide 2–4) (<i>Preferred Solution</i>)</li> <li>– 380 (district-wide 3–4)</li> </ul>
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 560 students in a District-wide Grades 2–4 elementary school.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 29, 2014
Invitation to Feasibility Study	September 24, 2014
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On March 30, 2016 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on July 20, 2016
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	47.21%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager (the "OPM")	P-Three, Inc.
Designer	Mount Vernon Group Architects, Inc.

## Discussion

The existing Sylvester Elementary School is a 32,377 square foot facility located on a 34.7 acre site that currently serves students in Grade 3 through Grade 4. The original school building was constructed in 1927 with an addition completed in 1960 and boiler replacements in 2005. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest ("SOI") for the existing Sylvester Elementary School including: poor energy efficiency; outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; and the presence of hazardous materials. In addition, the District's Sylvester School SOI identified numerous deficiencies associated with accessibility, overcrowding, and appropriateness of existing spaces to deliver the District's educational program. The Sylvester Elementary School shares its site with the 61,110 square foot Center Elementary School. The Center Elementary School was constructed in 1952 with additions completed in 1957 and 1998. The Center Elementary School currently serves students in Pre-Kindergarten through Grade 2.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions of the Sylvester Elementary School and the Center Elementary School, as well as the District's educational program. The assessment included input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on this assessment, the District and its consultants initially studied 14 preliminary options, which include two repair options, nine addition and renovation configurations, and three new construction options.

The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered:

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
1	Code upgrade to the existing Sylvester Elementary School
1A	Code upgrade to the existing Center Elementary School
2	Full renovation/no demolition/small addition to the existing Sylvester Elementary School to serve 230 students in Grades 3-4
3	Full renovation/minor demolition/large addition to the existing Sylvester Elementary School to serve 230 students in Grades 3-4
4	Full renovation/no demolition/small addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 415 students in Grades K-4

5	Full renovation/partial demolition/large addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 415 students in Grades K-4
5A	Full renovation/partial demolition/large addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 415 students in Grades K-4
6	Full demolition/new construction of the existing Center Elementary School to serve 415 students in Grades K-4
7	Full renovation/no demolition/small addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 560 students in Grades 2-4
8	Full renovation/partial demolition/large addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 560 students in Grades 2-4
9	Full demolition/new construction of the existing Center Elementary School to serve 560 students in Grades 2-4
10	Full renovation/partial demolition/small addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 380 students in Grades 3-4
11	Full renovation/partial demolition/large addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 380 students in Grades 3-4
12	Full demolition/new construction of the existing Center Elementary School to serve 380 students in Grades 3-4

Subsequent to the initial evaluation of potential solutions, the District analyzed the existing capacity at the Center Elementary School and Sylvester Elementary School facilities and the educational impacts of the three potential grade configurations that were evaluated as alternatives during the Sylvester Elementary School/Center Elementary School Feasibility Study. This analysis determined that the options with Grades 3-4 at the Center Elementary School and Grades K-2 at the Cedar Elementary School (“Option 10” and “Option 11”) would result in overpopulation at the Cedar Elementary School. Also, the District determined that due to the generally good condition of the Center Elementary School, the new construction options (“Option 6”, “Option 9” and “Option 12”) were too costly. Additionally, the District determined that options involving additions to the Sylvester Elementary School (“Options 2” and “Option 3”) were not viable because they were costly, retained a split campus, and maintained separation instead of meeting the goal to bring students and staff together in a single facility. The options below remained in consideration pending the decision of the School Committee to retain neighborhood elementary schools or change to a District-wide elementary school.

Option	Description
1	Code upgrade to the existing Sylvester Elementary School
1A	Code upgrade to the existing Center Elementary School
4	Full renovation/no demolition/small addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 415 students in Grades K-4
5	Full renovation/partial demolition/large addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 415 students in Grades K-4
5A	Full renovation/partial demolition/large addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 415 students in Grades K-4
7	Full renovation/no demolition/small addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 560 students in Grades 2-4
8	Full renovation/partial demolition/large addition to the existing Center Elementary School to serve 560 students in Grades 2-4

After further deliberation, the School Committee voted to support a District-wide solution that would move students in Grades 2-4 to one school and serve Pre-Kindergarten through Grade 1 students at the Cedar School. The District recognized the consistency, alignment, and equity that a District-wide solution would provide based upon the potential for increased professional development experiences, concentration of age-based expertise for teachers and staff, age appropriate amenities, physical common space, class-size equity, staffing flexibility during enrollment fluctuations, varied options for placement, and improved resource management.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District further developed variations, “Option 7A” and “Option 8A,” which provide an alternate cafeteria location to the original options. After further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to six final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below.

### Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sf)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction (cost*/sf) **	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1: (Base repair to the Sylvester School)	32,377	32,377 \$133/sf	N/A	\$452,362	\$4,749,891 \$147/sf	\$5,984,862
Option 1A: (Base repair to the Center School)	61,120	61,120 \$21/sf	N/A	\$335,182	\$1,592,115 \$26/sf	\$2,006,065
Option 7: (Small addition/ renovation – Cafeteria at back of building)	103,465	61,120 \$196/sf	42,345 \$325/sf	\$2,373,022	\$28,114,160 \$272/sf	\$34,299,275
Option 7A: (addition/renovation– Cafeteria at front of building)	102,665	61,120 \$193/sf	41,545 \$344/sf	\$2,439,380	\$28,497,127 \$278/sf	\$34,766,495
Option 8: (Addition/renovation– Cafeteria at back of building)	101,850	53,855 \$198/sf	47,995 \$335/sf	\$2,738,387	\$29,467,091 \$289/sf	\$35,949,851
<b>Option 8A: (Addition/renovation– Cafeteria at front of building)***</b>	<b>100,590</b>	<b>53,855 \$198/sf</b>	<b>46,735 \$337/sf</b>	<b>\$2,655,536</b>	<b>\$29,090,183 \$289/sf</b>	<b>\$35,490,024</b>

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District’s preferred option

The District has selected “Option 8A,” an addition and renovation project at the Center Elementary School to serve 560 students in Grades 2-4 District-wide, as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. Option 8A represents the District’s preferred solution to deliver its desired educational program within an existing, renovated facility. The District has stated that a

major advantage of Option 8A is the efficiency of the layout and the alignment to the educational program.

Although “Option 1” and “Option 1A” would improve the conditions of the existing facility, the District’s desired educational plan would not be fully accommodated. In addition, and based on evaluation of the existing conditions, “Option 1” and “Option 1A” would require full compliance with the current building code for new construction resulting in complex phasing and an extended construction duration.

“Option 7” and “Option 7A,” although utilizing more of the existing Center Elementary School, would retain an older, inefficient wing of the school that contains classrooms that lack proximity to other classrooms, which inhibits the delivery of the District’s proposed educational program. The wing would require complete renovations and re-planning which is undesirable for the District based on its estimated cost and inefficiency in comparison to “Options 8” and “8A.”

Based on the information provided, the District indicated that both “Option 8” and “Option 8A” meet the educational program goals of “creating neighborhoods clustering each grade level to provide increased opportunities for both staff and student collaboration throughout the day.” Additionally, “Option 8” is similar to “Option 8A” with the exception that the cafeteria was located at the rear of the school. After reviewing both options, the District determined that the cafeteria was better located in the front of the building because it improved the day to day logistics of student circulation, allowed for separation of public spaces from academic spaces, and allowed use during after-school hours.

The District’s Pre-Kindergarten through Grade 1 students will attend the Cedar Elementary School. After completion of the proposed project, the Sylvester Elementary School will be decommissioned.

At the March 9, 2016 Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) meeting, the District, owner’s project manager, and design team presented their overview of the options studied during the Feasibility Study, which included the District’s preferred solution to relocate students in Grades 2-4, currently attending the Cedar Elementary School and the Sylvester Elementary School, into a District-wide, Grade 2-4 school located at the existing Center Elementary School, after completion of the addition and renovation project. The FAS, MSBA staff, and the District discussed the following topics: 1) relationship of the alignment between the District’s educational plan and the proposed layout; 2) the importance of ample space to accommodate student circulation; 3) the potential for breakout spaces within the existing portion of the building; 4) courtyard maintenance; 5) maximizing use of outdoor spaces for educational use; 6) flexibility of grade structure within the building design; 7) the variation in classroom sizes between the existing and new building; 8) spaces to support the professional learning community; 9) the potential for E-rate funding; 10) consideration of FM enhancement for the hearing impaired; 11) the phasing and safety plan during occupied construction; and 12) adjacencies and incorporation of Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, and Math (STEAM) rooms throughout the building to align with the District’s educational goals.

Based on the District’s presentation and discussion at the March 9, 2016 FAS meeting, MSBA staff requested an update to the Preferred Schematic Report that describes through narratives and graphics the District’s considerations regarding the location of STEAM spaces so that these programs may be better incorporated into the core curriculum.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found that:

- 1) The options investigated in the Feasibility Study were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District's Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design process, prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, MSBA staff recommends that the Town of Hanover be approved to proceed into Schematic Design for a potential project that will relocate students in Grades 2-4, currently attending the Cedar Elementary School and the Sylvester Elementary School, into a District-wide, Grade 2-4 school located at the existing Center Elementary School, after completion of an addition and renovation project to Center Elementary School.