

District: Town of Bourne
 School Name: James F. Peebles Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: July 13, 2016

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Bourne, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing James F. Peebles Elementary School with a new District-wide grades 3-5 elementary school on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Bourne
Elementary Schools	Bournedale Elementary School (PK-4) James F. Peebles Elementary School (K-4)
Middle School	Bourne Middle School (5-8)
High School	Bourne High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	James F. Peebles Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-4
Year Opened	1953
Existing Square Footage	55,191
Additions	1959: Two-story addition 1998: Roof replacement and partial boiler replacement
Acreage of Site	8.6 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural integrity - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Envelope - Windows - Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2015-2016 Enrollment	330
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - 885 (K-5, District-wide elementary school) - 725 (K-4, District-wide elementary school) - 410 (K-4, James F. Peebles Elementary School student population, including a District-wide Grade 5) - 250 (K-4, James F. Peebles Elementary School student population) - 460 (3-5 District-wide, at the James F. Peebles Elementary School) (<i>Preferred Solution</i>)

District Information	
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 460 students in grades 3-5, District-wide.

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	June 4, 2014
Invitation to Feasibility Study	January 14, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On July 20, 2016 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on November 9, 2016
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	43.84%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Symmes Maini & McKee Associates, Inc.
Designer	Flansburgh Architects, Inc.

Discussion

As part of the Feasibility Study, MSBA staff agreed with the District’s request to explore options that include various consolidation alternatives for the District’s grades K-5 student population resulting in four study design enrollments: 250 students for a grades K-4 (current configuration); 725 students for a District-wide grades K-4; 885 students for a District-wide grades K-5; and 420 students for a grades K-4, including a District-wide grade 5. The study performed included the evaluation of the District’s two existing elementary schools: the James F. Peebles Elementary School and the Bournedale Elementary School.

The existing James F. Peebles Elementary School is a 55,191 square foot facility located on an 8.6 acre site that currently serves students in grades K-4. The site is adjacent to the Bourne Middle School (6-8) and the Bourne High School (9-12). The original school building was constructed in 1953, with a two-story addition constructed in 1959. In addition, the roof of the original building and one of the two original boilers were replaced in 1998. The District’s Statement of Interest (“SOI”) identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with outdated mechanical, electrical and plumbing systems, non-compliant accessibility conditions, and the appropriateness of existing spaces to deliver its educational program.

The existing Bournedale Elementary School is a 68,120 square foot facility located on the off-cape “mainland” side of Bourne that currently serves students in grades PK-4. The original school building was constructed in 2009.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions of the James F. Peebles Elementary School and the Bournedale Elementary School, as well as the educational program. The assessment included input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on this assessment, the District and its consultants initially studied eight preliminary options that included a base repair option, five addition/renovation options, and two new construction options.

The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives considered:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
0	Base repair at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4; 250 students)
1A	New construction at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4; 250 students)
1G	Addition/renovation at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4; 250 students)
2A	Addition/renovation at the Bournedale Elementary School (District-wide grades PK-4; 725 students)
3A	Addition/renovation at the Bournedale Elementary School (District-wide grades PK-5; 885 students)
3B	Addition/renovation at the Bournedale Elementary School (District-wide grades PK-5; 885 students)
4A	New construction at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4 including a District-wide grade 5; 410 students)
4B	Addition/renovation at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4 including a District-wide grade 5; 410 students)

It was determined that a “Base Repair” Option would not be considered for further evaluation because it does not address issues associated with the delivery of the District’s Educational Program. “Option 1G” was not considered for further evaluation because of a longer construction duration, disruption to students, and the condition of the existing building resulting in an estimated cost almost equal to the cost of a new school. In addition, “Options 3A” and “3B” were not considered for further evaluation because of the size, potential traffic issues, and site limitations.

As a result of further analysis, the District wished to consider an additional option based on a District-wide school for grades 3-5 at the James F. Peebles Elementary School site. The District contacted the MSBA and requested an enrollment number for this option on March 17, 2016. This option includes redistricting and a reconfiguration of grades resulting in District-wide schools serving students in PK-2 at the Bournedale Elementary School, grades 3-5 at the James F. Peebles Elementary School, and grades 6-8 at the Bourne Middle School. Per the District’s request, the MSBA offered an additional study enrollment recommendation on March 24, 2016 for 460 students serving a District-wide grades 3-5 population at the James F. Peebles Elementary School, for planning and study purposes.

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to five final Options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below. Please note that the “Base Repair” Option was not considered a viable Option, but is being included for cost comparison purposes only.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options:

Option: Description	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/ sf.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/ sf.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<u>Base Repair:</u> No build option at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4; 250 students)	37,557 sf	37,557 sf \$280/sf	N/A	\$1,549,507	\$12,065,467 \$321/sf	\$16,800,000
<u>Option 1A:</u> New construction at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4; 250 students)	57,248 sf	N/A	57,248 sf \$395/sf	\$5,744,805	\$28,357,765 \$495/sf	\$36,494,586
<u>Option 2A:</u> Add/reno at the Bournedale Elementary School (District-wide grades PK-4; 725 students)	62,293 sf	15,800 sf \$370/sf	46,493 sf \$411/sf	\$4,799,156	\$29,753,779 \$478/sf	\$38,634,459
<u>Option 4A:</u> New construction at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4 including a District-wide grade 5; 410 students)	72,473 sf	N/A	72,473 sf \$361/sf	\$5,856,283	\$32,019,036 \$442/sf	\$41,288,273
<u>Option 4B:</u> Add/reno at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (Grades K-4 including a District-wide grade 5; 410 students)	72,473 sf	37,557 \$356/sf	34,886 \$397/sf	\$5,416,911	\$32,636,945 \$450/sf	\$42,780,965
<i>Option 5A: New construction at the James F. Peebles Elementary School (District-wide grades 3-5; 460 students)***</i>	<i>72,680 sf</i>	<i>N/A</i>	<i>72,680 sf \$360/sf</i>	<i>\$5,900,657</i>	<i>\$32,065,457 \$441/sf</i>	<i>\$41,492,585</i>

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

******District's preferred option***

The District has selected “Option 5A”, which replaces the existing James F. Peebles Elementary School with a new District-wide grades 3-5 facility on the existing site as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected this option as its preferred alternative because it meets the needs of the District’s Educational Program, addresses the deficiencies of the current facility, creates an equal educational experience for all elementary school students, and it allows for the fifth grade to be included in an elementary school setting.

“Options 1A” and “2A” were not considered for further evaluation because these Options do not address the District’s desire to relocate the fifth grade population into an elementary school setting. In addition, “Options 4A” and “4B” were not considered for further evaluation because of the concerns for educational and social development associated with Bournedale Elementary

School students making two school building transitions, one when entering 5th grade at the Peebles Elementary School and then again when entering 6th grade at the Bourne Middle School.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on June 29, 2016. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed: the function of the stage, the Innovation Studio, and the outside classroom; the importance of providing professional development for staff and limiting the number of student transitions; and the design of the entry, site circulation, and the location of the parent pick-up/drop-off area. Additionally, the members of the FAS discussed: how the integration of technology throughout the school should be driven by the curriculum; the benefits of having FM systems within the classroom; the flexibility of classroom sizes and furniture; handicap design provisions and accessibility; and the community’s support of the proposed grade reconfiguration.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Bourne be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing James F. Peebles Elementary School with a new District-wide grades 3-5 elementary school on the existing site.