

District: Town of Ipswich  
 School Name: Winthrop Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: December 6, 2017

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Ipswich, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to consolidate the student population of the existing Winthrop Elementary School and Doyon Elementary School into a new building serving grades PK-5 on the existing Doyon Elementary School site, which supersedes the consolidated student population of the existing Winthrop Elementary School and Doyon Elementary School into a new building serving grades PK-5 on the existing Winthrop Elementary School site approved on February 15, 2017. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Ipswich
Elementary School(s)	Doyon Elementary School (PK-5) Winthrop Elementary School (PK-5)
Middle School(s)	Ipswich Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Ipswich High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Winthrop Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	PK-5
Year Opened	1956
Existing Square Footage	50,600
Additions	7 classroom and library addition in 1993 2 classroom modular unit added in 2000 1 elevator addition in 1985
Acreage of Site	8 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Mechanical systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Envelope</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2016-2017 Enrollment	383
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 775 students, District-wide Grades K-5 (Preferred Solution)</li> <li>- 355 students, District-wide Grades K-2</li> <li>- 490 students, District-wide Grades K-3</li> <li>- 420 students, Winthrop ES K-5</li> </ul>
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 775 students for grades K-5, for a project that

<b>District Information</b>	
	will serve grades Pre-kindergarten through grade 5.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	June 4, 2014
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 25, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On December 13, 2017 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on April 10, 2018.
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	45.74%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	PMA Consultants, LLC
Designer	Perkins Eastman/DPC

**Background**

On February 15, 2017 the MSBA Board of Directors approved the Town of Ipswich to proceed into Schematic Design to consolidate the existing Winthrop Elementary School and Doyon Elementary School in a new 123,700 gross square foot elementary school serving grades PK-5 on the existing Winthrop Elementary School site. Subsequently, the Town reconsidered the site selection associated with its preferred solution and requested, through correspondence dated August 1, 2017 to the MSBA, a ten-month extension to the duration of its Feasibility Study Agreement, to evaluate and develop a preferred solution that would continue to consolidate the existing Winthrop and Doyon Elementary School student population into a single building, but at the existing Doyon Elementary School site.

On August 23, 2017, the MSBA Board of Directors authorized the Executive Director to extend the expiration date of the Feasibility Study Agreement between the MSBA and the Town of Ipswich, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study for the Winthrop Elementary School, from September 25, 2017 through June 30, 2018.

A copy of the Preferred Schematic Recommendation for the Winthrop Elementary School project, dated February 8, 2017, which was presented to the MSBA Board of Directors on February 15, 2017, is attached for reference.

**Discussion**

To address the concerns raised by the community early in the Schematic Design phase of the project, the District determined additional time was required to re-evaluate the proposed location of the preferred solution. In light of the continued local concern regarding impacts associated with the existing Winthrop Site, the School Building Committee and School Committee decided to relocate the preferred solution to the existing Doyon Elementary School site.

With the decision to relocate the proposed new school to the existing Doyon Elementary School site, the District and design team were able to focus on refining the preferred schematic concept while adapting to the new site. Addressing community concerns regarding traffic, parking, and site circulation, while maintaining and enhancing the educational planning aspects became the goal of the project team in an effort to submit an updated Preferred Schematic Report to the MSBA. Based on this effort, updated preliminary pricing was established for the following options:

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Feet</b>	<b>Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Site, Building Takedown, Hazmat Cost*</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Project Costs</b>
Option 1: Base Repair of Winthrop ES	50,600	50,600 \$240/sq. ft.	0 \$0/sq. ft.	\$1,720,487	\$13,864,487 \$274/sq. ft.	\$18,889,706
Option 2: Addition/ Renovation of Winthrop ES	123,700	50,600 \$247/sq. ft.	73,100 \$407/sq. ft.	\$6,702,839	\$48,952,739 \$395.74/sq. ft.	\$60,865,137
Option 3: New Construction at Winthrop ES site	123,700	0 \$0/sq. ft.	123,700 \$385/sq. ft.	\$6,288,997	\$53,913,497 \$435.84/sq. ft.	\$66,687,466
<b><i>Option 3A: New Construction at Doyon ES site***</i></b>	<b><i>123,700</i></b>	<b><i>0 \$0/sq. ft.</i></b>	<b><i>123,700 \$409/sq. ft.</i></b>	<b><i>\$5,152,255</i></b>	<b><i>\$55,755,664 \$451/sq. ft.</i></b>	<b><i>\$69,789,268</i></b>

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District’s preferred solution

As a result of further evaluation of the Doyon site, and refined conceptual layout, the District selected “Option 3A” as their preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected this option as its preferred solution because it best meets the needs of the District’s educational program and addresses community issues and concerns related to parking and traffic associated with the Winthrop Elementary School site. In addition, “Option 3A” allows the District to create its ideal learning environment for increased student and teacher participation methods, and creates a level of educational flexibility and adaptation as the educational program continues to evolve. The District has determined that this option also offers improved ecological literacy and use of outdoor spaces as educational advantages that were not available with the Winthrop Elementary School site.

“Option 1” was not selected for further evaluation as the District determined that this option was not viable because the existing building does not support the space required to deliver its

educational program and does not address overcrowding concerns. Although “Option 2” presented a possible solution to address overcrowding, by adding a third- story classroom wing, this option creates a compromised alternative for team and flexible learning spaces. Furthermore, the District indicated that these options do not meet the needs of the District’s educational plan.

As a result of the District’s decision to discontinue/replace the existing Winthrop Elementary School for which the District received a previous construction grant from the Commonwealth, and pursuant to the MSBA’s enabling statute and regulations, the MSBA will recover a pro-rated portion of the grant that the District received for the previous project at the Winthrop Elementary School. MSBA records indicate a total grant payment of \$285,976 for the Winthrop Elementary School Roof and Boiler Replacement Project, #W20034400, where the final payment was made in March 2006. The estimated recovery amount is approximately \$71,500. The exact amount to be recovered will be established at the conclusion of the Schematic Design phase.

The District presented its updated proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on November 15, 2017. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed a number of topics including: how the preferred solution aligns with the District’s educational program; comparison of this proposed project to the previously approved building and site; the District’s educational plan; accessibility; location of Special Education spaces; location of elevators; the District’s commitment to a co-teaching model; location of teacher’s collaboration spaces; site circulation and parking; proposed building connection to the forest and methods of engagement; ownership of the adjacent properties; impact of potential flooding and infiltration; and the feasibility of an addition/renovation on the Doyon site.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District will submit an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Ipswich be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to consolidate the student population of the existing Winthrop Elementary School and Doyon Elementary School into a new building serving grades PK-5 on the

existing Doyon Elementary School site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's preferred solution.

District                                      Town of Ipswich  
 School Name:                                Winthrop Elementary School  
 Recommended Category:                Preferred Schematic  
 Date:    February 8, 2017

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Ipswich, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to consolidate the existing Winthrop Elementary School and Doyon Elementary School in a new building on the existing Winthrop Elementary School site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Ipswich
Elementary School(s)	Doyon Elementary School (PK-5) Winthrop Elementary School (PK-5)
Middle School(s)	Ipswich Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Ipswich High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Winthrop Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	PK-5
Year Opened	1956
Existing Square Footage	41,000
Additions	7 classroom and library addition in 1993 2 classroom modular unit added in 2000 1 elevator addition in 1985
Acreage of Site	8 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Mechanical systems</li> <li>- Electrical systems</li> <li>- Envelope</li> <li>- Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2016-2017 Enrollment	383
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 775, District-wide Grades K-5</li> <li>- 355, District-wide Grades K-2</li> <li>- 490, District-wide Grades K-3</li> <li>- 420, Two District elementary schools K-5</li> </ul>
	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 775 students for grades K-5, for a project that will serve grades PK-5.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	June 4, 2014
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 25, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On February 15, 2017 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on June 28, 2017
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	45.74%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner's Project Manager (the "OPM")	PMA Consultants, LLC
Designer	Perkins Eastman/DPC

## **Discussion**

The existing Winthrop Elementary School is a 41,000 square foot building located on an eight-acre site and currently serves grades PK-5. The existing facility was originally constructed in 1956 as an elementary school that served students in grades 3-5.

In 1985, the District added an elevator and, in 1993, a library and seven classrooms were added. The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest that are associated with: outdated mechanical, electrical and plumbing systems, non-compliant accessibility conditions, severe overcrowding, and space constraints inhibiting the District's ability to deliver its educational program. The District also identified poor energy efficiency performance for the existing facility because of the building envelope and roof conditions. The District replaced the roof and boilers in 2005 and installed a one hundred gallon domestic hot water heater in 2008 to try to make the facility more energy efficient.

As part of the Feasibility Study, the District explored options that include various consolidation alternatives of the Doyon and Winthrop Elementary Schools for the District's grades K-5 student population. This effort resulted in the following four study design enrollments: 420 students for grades K-5; 490 students for a District-wide K-3; 355 students for a District-wide K-2, and a 775 student District-wide K-5.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District determined that two of the five sites initially considered, which include the existing Winthrop School site, the Doyon School site, the Bialek Park site, the Green Street site, and the Mile Lane site, are not viable options for further evaluation. The Green Street site is not considered feasible because of significant soil concerns and restrictions for traffic and parking. The Mile Lane site was removed from consideration because of its proximity to the Doyon Elementary School site, significant field replication, and site restrictions. The District and its consultants initially studied fourteen (14) preliminary options that include two (2) addition/renovation configurations and twelve (12) new construction options at the Winthrop, Doyon, and Bialek sites. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary alternatives that were considered.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
W3a	Addition/Renovation at the existing Winthrop Elementary School facility: <i>New eight classroom academic wing.</i>
W3b	Addition/Renovation at the existing Winthrop Elementary School facility: <i>Third floor addition.</i>
W1a	New Construction at the existing Winthrop Elementary School site: <i>A 3-story building</i>
W2a	New Construction at the existing Winthrop Elementary School site: <i>A 3-story building</i>
B1a	New Construction at the Bialek Park site: <i>A 2-story building</i>
B2a	New Construction at the Bialek Park site: <i>A 2-story building</i>
B3a	New Construction at the Bialek Park site: <i>A 3-story building</i>
B3b	New Construction at the Bialek Park site: <i>A 3-story building</i>
D1a	New Construction at the Doyon Elementary School site: <i>A 2-story building</i>
D1b	New Construction at the Doyon Elementary School site: <i>A 3-story building</i>
D1c	New Construction at the Doyon Elementary School site: <i>A 3-story building</i>
D2a	New Construction at the Doyon Elementary School site: <i>A 2-story building with expanded site.</i>
D3a	New Construction at the Doyon Elementary School site: <i>A 3-story building with expanded site.</i>
D3b	New Construction at the Doyon Elementary School site: <i>A 3-story building with expanded site.</i>

\*Note: All options are for a District-wide, grades K-5 solution with an enrollment of 775 students.

As a result of further evaluation and refined plans, the District determined that the options for a grades K-5 configuration on the Doyon Elementary School site are not viable because of limitations on the site, community concerns, and location. Furthermore, the Doyon site does not support the need for a walkable school in close proximity to downtown Ipswich and those who rely heavily on public transportation. In addition, the existing Bialek Park site was considered a viable site with respect to its size and configuration and was free from any Article 97 restrictions; however, the Ipswich Board of Selectmen would not authorize the transfer of the park from the Town to the School Department because the Selectmen preferred that the site remain exclusively dedicated to the ball fields and playground currently established at Bialek Park.

The District and its consultants determined that the existing Winthrop Elementary School site best meets the needs of the educational program and most effectively addresses community concerns. The following is a list of the preliminary alternative options that were further evaluated:

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description</b>
W3.B	Addition/Renovation at the existing Winthrop Elementary School facility: <i>Third Floor Addition.</i>
W2A.1	New Construction at the existing Winthrop Elementary School site – <i>Three story building</i>
W2A.2	New Construction at the existing Winthrop Elementary School site – <i>Three story building</i>



W2A.3	New Construction at the existing Winthrop Elementary School site – <i>Three story building</i>
W2A.4	New Construction at the existing Winthrop Elementary School site – <i>Three story building</i>

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to three final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

<b>Option (Description)</b>	<b>Total Gross Square Feet</b>	<b>Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Site, Building Takedown, Hazmat Cost*</b>	<b>Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)</b>	<b>Estimated Total Project Costs</b>
Option: 1 'Base Repair'	50,600	50,600 \$240/sq. ft.	0 \$0/sq. ft.	\$1,720,487	\$13,864,487 \$274/sq. ft.	\$18,889,706
Option: 2 W3B 'Addition/Reno.'	123,700	50,600 \$247/sq. ft.	73,100 \$407/sq. ft.	\$6,702,839	\$48,952,739 \$395.74/sq. ft.	\$60,865,137
<b>Option: 3 W2A.4 'New Construction'***</b>	<b>123,700</b>	<b>0 \$0/sq. ft.</b>	<b>123,700 \$385/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$6,288,997</b>	<b>\$53,913,497 \$435.84/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$66,687,466</b>

\* *Marked up construction costs*

\*\* *Does not include construction contingency*

\*\*\**District's preferred option*

The District has selected “Option 3” (W2A.4), which replaces the existing Winthrop Elementary School with a facility serving students in grades PK-5 District-wide, on the existing site, as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected this option as its preferred solution because it best meets the needs of the District’s educational program, allows the school community to create its ideal learning environment for increased student and teacher participation methods, and creates a level of educational flexibility and adaptation as the educational program continues to evolve.

“Option 1” (Base Repair) and “Option 2” (W3.B) were not selected for further evaluation. The District determined that “Option 1” is not viable because the existing structure is not able to address the overcrowding concerns without the addition of a third-floor level. Additionally, the District determined that, although “Option 2” offered a possible solution by adding a third- story classroom wing, this option creates a compromised alternative for team and flexible learning spaces. These two options contemplate occupied construction, with phasing, and would result in a

significant compromise in the overall space-planning and layout of the facility. Furthermore, the District indicated that these options do not meet the need of the District's educational plan.

Based on the District's plan to replace a school for which it received a school building grant from the Commonwealth and pursuant to the MSBA's enabling statute and regulations, the MSBA will recover a pro-rated portion of the grant that the District received for the previous project at the Winthrop School. MSBA records indicate a total grant payment of \$285,976 for the Ipswich Winthrop Elementary School Roof and Boiler Replacement Project, #W20034400, for which the final payment was made in March 2006. The estimated recovery amount, based on the information provided in the District's submittals to date, is approximately \$71,500. The exact amount to be recovered will be established at the conclusion of the Schematic Design phase.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on February 1, 2017. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed a number of topics regarding: the District's preferred solution and how it aligns with the educational program; the collaboration between the District, project team, staff, and local residents; the level of outreach and community engagement; location and delivery of maker space areas; the tightness of the site and local discussions regarding off-site parking for staff; the vision of the District's co-teaching method and the implementation; consideration of covered entrances for handicap accessibility; and the schedule for local authorization and funding.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this Feasibility Study was appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District's Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to better understand the total area associated with health and physical education, and how this space serves the student population and the renovation of the existing facility.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.
- 7) Pursuant to the MSBA's enabling legislation, the MSBA's regulations, and the District's proposed plan to replace the existing Winthrop Elementary School for which it received a school building grant from the Commonwealth for a prior project, the MSBA will recover

a pro-rated portion of the grant that the District received for the previous project. The estimated recovery amount, based on the information provided in the District's submittals to date, is approximately \$71,500. The exact amount to be recovered will be established at the conclusion of the Schematic Design Phase.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Ipswich be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to consolidate the existing Winthrop Elementary School and Doyon Elementary School in a new building on the existing Winthrop Elementary School site.