

District: Town of Saugus  
 School Name: Saugus High School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: February 8, 2017

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Saugus, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Saugus High School with a new grades 6-12 middle/high school on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Saugus
Elementary School(s)	Ballard School (PK) Douglas Waybright Elementary School (K-5) Lynnhurst Elementary School (K-5) Oaklandvale Elementary School (K-5) Veterans Memorial Elementary School (K-5)
Middle School(s)	Belmonte Middle School (6-8)
High School(s)	Saugus High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Saugus High School
Type of School	High School
Grades Served	9-12
Year Opened	1954
Existing Square Footage	193,200
Additions	1960 addition 1972 addition
Acreage of Site	21.74 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Structural integrity</li> <li>– Mechanical systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Plumbing systems</li> <li>– Envelope</li> <li>– Windows</li> <li>– Roof</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2016-2017 Enrollment	715
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– 700 students in a grades 9-12 configuration</li> <li>– 1,360 students in a grades 6-12 configuration (<i>Preferred Solution</i>)</li> </ul>

<b>District Information</b>	
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 1,360 students in grades 6-12.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 14, 2015
Invitation to Feasibility Study	August 6, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On February 15, 2017 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on June 28, 2017
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	53.32%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	PMA Consultants, LLC
Designer	HMFH Architects

## **Discussion**

As part of the Feasibility Study, MSBA staff agreed with the District’s request to explore various consolidation options resulting in two study design enrollments, including 700 students for a grades 9-12 configuration and 1,360 students for a grades 6-12 configuration. The Feasibility Study includes the evaluation of a District-wide grade reconfiguration and studies the impacts that may result from the potential project.

The existing Saugus High School is a 193,200 square foot facility located on a 21.74 acre site that currently serves students in grades 9-12. The original school building, which was constructed in 1954, is 113,094 square feet, with a 22,141 square foot addition in 1960 and a 57,965 square foot addition in 1972. The roof was then replaced in 1991 and the boilers were replaced in 2003. The District’s Statement of Interest identifies numerous deficiencies in the existing building including: outdated mechanical, electrical and plumbing systems; accessibility issues; and the appropriateness of existing spaces to deliver the District’s educational program.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District was able to determine that two of the three sites initially considered, which include the existing Saugus High School site, the Cedar Glen Golf Course site, and the Curley Property site, are not viable options for further evaluation. The Cedar Glen Golf Course site is not considered to be viable because it is not owned by the Town. The Curley Property site is not considered to be viable because it is unbuildable due to site topography and wetlands. Therefore, the District and its consultants initially studied 11 preliminary options that include: one base repair alternative, six addition/renovation configurations, and four new construction options at the existing Saugus High School site. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary options considered:

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
0.1	Renovation Only at the existing Saugus High School facility: <i>Base Repair</i> (Grades 9-12; 700 students)
0.2	New Construction at the existing Saugus High School site: <i>A 4-story building</i> (Grades 9-12; 700 students)
0.2a	New Construction at the existing Saugus High School site: <i>A 3-story building</i> (Grades 9-12; 700 students)
0.3	Addition/Renovation at the existing Saugus High School facility: <i>An addition for gymnasium and support spaces and administration</i> (Grades 9-12; 700 students)
0.4a	Addition/Renovation at the existing Saugus High School facility: <i>An addition for the academic HS core spaces and two separate 2<sup>nd</sup> floor additions</i> (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)
0.4b	Addition/Renovation at the existing Saugus High School facility: <i>An addition for the academic MS core spaces and two separate 2<sup>nd</sup> floor additions</i> (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)
1	Addition/Renovation at the existing Saugus High School facility: <i>An addition for the academic HS core spaces and 2 three story additions</i> (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)
1a	Addition/Renovation at the existing Saugus High School facility: <i>An addition for the academic MS core spaces and 2 three story additions</i> (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)
2	Addition/Renovation at the existing Saugus High School facility: <i>An addition for the academic HS core spaces and 2 three story additions, and a gymnasium and support spaces addition in the location of the existing gymnasiums</i> (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)
3	New Construction at the existing Saugus High School site: <i>A 4-story building</i> (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)
3a	New Construction at the existing Saugus High School site: <i>A 3-story building</i> (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)

As a result of further evaluation, the District determined that the grades 9-12 configurations (“Options 0.1, 0.2, 0.2a, and 0.3”) are not viable options for the Town because these options do not meet the needs of the District’s educational program and do not address the current issues at the elementary school level.

“Options 0.4a, 0.4b, and 1a” are not considered viable options and were not further evaluated because these proposed options result in a large and sprawling building footprint, they required complex phasing, and they do not result in layouts that meet the needs of the District’s educational program. . Additionally, “Option 3a” was not further evaluated because it resulted in a building footprint that was too large for the preferred location on the site.

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to three options (“Options 1, 2, and 3”) for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below. Please note that three additional options (“Options 0.1, 0.2, and 0.3”) were included in this next phase of evaluation for cost comparison purposes only.

## Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Options (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<u>Option 0.1:</u> Base Repair (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students) <i>Cost Comparison Only</i>	187,625	187,625 \$339/sq. ft.	N/A	\$25,171,979	\$88,736,630 \$473/sq. ft.	\$112,485,214
<u>Option 0.2:</u> New Construction (Grades 9-12; 700 students) <i>Cost Comparison Only</i>	163,155	N/A	163,155 \$413/sq. ft.	\$21,266,061	\$88,618,354 \$543/sq. ft.	\$112,335,284
<u>Option 0.3:</u> Addition/Renovation (Grades 9-12; 700 students) <i>Cost Comparison Only</i>	182,197	136,952 \$366/sq. ft.	45,245 \$521/sq. ft.	\$22,851,685	\$96,609,988 \$530/sq. ft.	\$122,465,719
<u>Option 1:</u> Addition/Renovation (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)	294,586	143,646 \$384/sq. ft.	150,940 \$439/sq. ft.	\$23,293,764	\$144,633,955 \$491/sq. ft.	\$183,342,340
<u>Option 2:</u> Addition/Renovation (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)	280,586	98,918 \$321/sq. ft.	181,668 \$506/sq. ft.	\$28,379,561	\$152,034,819 \$542/sq. ft.	\$192,482,828
<u>Option 3:***</u> <b>New Construction (Grades 6-12; 1,360 students)</b>	<b>271,320</b>	<b>N/A</b>	<b>271,320 \$380/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$24,889,809</b>	<b>\$127,885,356 \$471/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$160,860,953</b>

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\***District's preferred option**

The District has selected “Option 3”, which replaces the existing Saugus High School with a new grades 6-12 facility on the existing site as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected this option as its preferred solution because it meets the needs of the District’s educational program, optimizes program adjacencies while creating flexible learning spaces, has the shortest construction duration, has the least amount of disruption to educational delivery without any short-term loss of program spaces, and it is the most cost-effective solution.

Additionally, the preferred solution will result in a District-wide grade reconfiguration that will reconfigure the Veterans Memorial Elementary School, which currently serves grades K-5, to a grades PK-2 facility; reconfigure the Belmonte Middle School, which currently serves grades 6-8, to a grades 3-5 facility and include the District Offices; and close four elementary schools. The MSBA will not be participating in any of the costs associated with this work. Also, based on the District’s plan to reconfigure the Belmonte Middle School, a school for which the City received a

school building grant from the Commonwealth for a prior project, and pursuant to the MSBA's enabling statute and regulations, the MSBA will recover a pro-rated portion of the grant that the District received for the previous project. MSBA records indicate a total grant of \$9,779,500 for the Belmonte Middle School Repair Project, #201002620305, which was completed in September 2013. The estimated recovery amount, based on the information provided in the District's submittals to date, is approximately \$1.75 million. The exact amount to be recovered will be established at the conclusion of the Schematic Design phase.

"Option 1" and "Option 2" were not considered for further evaluation because these options would result in occupied, phased construction that would require a longer construction duration and produce a larger facility than required. Additionally, these options do not meet the needs of the District's educational plan and would result in a higher total estimated project cost than "Option 3".

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") on February 1, 2017. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following: the MSBA's Science Lab Initiative; the District's educational program; the need to provide two means of egress out of each science lab; the benefits of providing professional development for staff; the function of the project areas and a reminder to be intentional with how the spaces are used and scheduled; security; concerns with the proposed layout related to lack of light and views to the outside from the common spaces; the importance of creating an inviting environment and caution against comprising the essential design considerations; and community outreach.

As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA requests the District submit the following information:

- A revised Educational Program that: better explains the District's vision for project based learning and contemporary learning practices, plans for professional development to support staff and students impacted by the transition, and incorporates the Designer's response as to how the floor plans accommodate the District's educational vision;
- Description using narratives and graphics that explain the design strategies and features to be implemented in order to incorporate daylight, views, promote way-finding, and the creation of an inviting environment;
- Updated floor plans; and
- Verification that the updated layouts, organization and adjacencies of classrooms, shared spaces for the middle school and high school students, and the separation of classrooms and core areas available for community use outside of school hours each align with the educational needs as documented by the District.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated are sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study is appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.

- 3) The District's Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) The MSBA requests that the District be available to present the updated preferred solution to the FAS should the MSBA determine that an updated presentation is required. This update would ensure a mutual understanding and agreement of the proposed project scope and ensure that this scope will be reflected in the District's Schematic Design submittal.
- 6) All future study, design, and construction work associated with the Veterans Memorial Elementary School and the Belmonte Middle School are at the District's sole expense and must be locally approved and authorized separately from the proposed middle-high school project.
- 7) Pursuant to the MSBA's enabling legislation, the MSBA's regulations, and the District's proposed plan to reconfigure the Belmonte Middle School for which it received a school building grant from the Commonwealth for a prior project, the MSBA will recover a pro-rated portion of the financial assistance that the District has received for the previous project. The estimated recovery amount, based on the information provided in the District's submittals to date, is approximately \$1.75 million. The exact amount to be recovered will be established at the conclusion of the Schematic Design phase.
- 8) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Saugus be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Saugus High School with a new grades 6-12 middle/high school on the existing site.