District: Town of Westport
School Name: Westport Middle School
Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
Date: February 8, 2017

## Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Westport, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Westport Middle School with a new District-wide grades 5-12 middle/high school on the existing site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District's preferred solution.

As requested by the District in its Feasibility Study, staff has also performed a review of available model school designs and has determined that one model, the Longmeadow High School design, by OMR Architects, could potentially meet the District's needs. Consequently, staff further recommend that the Executive Director be authorized to (1) allow the Town of Westport to consider using the Longmeadow High School as a potential model school design candidate and, (2) if the Town of Westport chooses to formally evaluate the Longmeadow High School as a potential model school design candidate, to allow the Town to evaluate both the model school design (Longmeadow High School) and the District's Preferred Solution design ("Option G.9") and to proceed with interviews of their respective designers to determine which design best meets the District's educational needs. Prior to commencing Schematic Design for the replacement of the existing Westport Middle School with a new District-wide grades 5-12 middle/high school on the existing site, the District will choose to proceed with the designer of the original preferred solution or the designer of the Longmeadow High School.

<b>District Information</b>						
District Name	Town of Westport					
Elementary Schools	Alice A. Macomber Primary School (PK-2)					
	Westport Elementary School (3-6)					
Middle School	Westport Middle School, closed September 2015					
High School	Westport High School (7-12)					
Priority School Name	Westport Middle School					
Type of School	Middle School					
Grades Served	6-8					
Year Opened	1969					
Existing Square Footage	115,592					
Additions	N/A					
Acreage of Site	7 acres					
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas:					
	<ul> <li>Mechanical systems</li> </ul>					
	<ul> <li>Electrical systems</li> </ul>					
	<ul> <li>Plumbing systems</li> </ul>					
	- Envelope					
	- Windows					
	- Roof					
	- Accessibility					
	In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the					

<b>District Information</b>					
	existing facility: does not provide the space needed to deliver its educational program, is contaminated with polychlorinated biphenyls ("PCBs"), and is unfit to serve as a school facility. The facility closed in September 2015.				
Original Design Capacity	Unknown				
2014-2015 Enrollment	404				
2015-2016 Enrollment	N/A				
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations:				
	- 505 (District-wide grades 5-8)				
	- 380 (District-wide grades 6-8)				
	- 860 (District-wide grades 5-12) (Preferred Solution)				
	- 735 (District-wide grades 6-12)				
	- 610 (District-wide grades 7-12)				
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board's approval of the preferred solution, the				
	District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 860				
	students in grades 5-12, District-wide.				

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 14, 2015
Invitation to Feasibility Study	August 6, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On February 15, 2017 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on June
	28, 2017
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate	46.79%
(Incentive points are not applicable)	

Consultants	
Owner's Project Manager (the "OPM")	Daedalus Projects, Inc.
Designer	Jonathan Levi Architects

## **Discussion**

As part of the Feasibility Study, MSBA staff agreed with the District's request to explore options that include various consolidation alternatives for the District's grade 5-12 student population, resulting in the following five study enrollment options:

- 505 students for a District-wide grades 5-8 configuration;
- 380 students for a District-wide grades 6-8 configuration;
- 860 students for a District-wide grades 5-12 configuration;
- 735 students for a District-wide grades 6-12 configuration; and
- 610 students for a District-wide grades 7-12 configuration (current configuration).

The existing Westport Middle School is a 115,592 square foot facility, located on a seven acre site, which is adjacent to the Westport Elementary School and the Town Library. The original school building was constructed in 1969. The roof of the original building was replaced in 1990 and the boilers were replaced in 1999.

The District's Statement of Interest ("SOI") identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; non-compliant accessibility conditions; and lack of space to deliver the District's educational program.

In 2013, the Westport Middle School was invited to participate in the MSBA's Green Repair program. However, due to the level of PCB contamination discovered in the facility, the District removed its Statement of Interest in March 2012.

The District partially remediated the PCB's to keep the building open, however, PCB's still exist in the concrete substrate, exterior masonry, and soil around the perimeter of the building. Due to ongoing safety concerns of the community, in September 2015, the Westport Middle School was closed. As a result, students in grades 7-8 were relocated to the Westport High School and students in grade 6 were relocated to Westport Elementary School. Currently, Westport has three operating school facilities: the Alice A. Macomber School, which serves students in grades PK-2; the Westport Elementary School, which serves students in grades 3-6; and the Westport High School, which serves students in grades 7-12.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied three potential sites: the existing Westport Middle School site; the existing Westport High School site; and the Santos Farm site. This analysis studied 23 preliminary options that include: one code upgrade option at the existing Westport Middle School facility; seven addition/renovation options, two of which are major renovation options at the Westport Middle School facility and five of which are addition/renovation options at the Westport High School facility; and 15 new construction options, which include five options at the existing Westport Middle School site, five options at the existing Westport High School site, and five options at the Santos Farm site. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary options that were considered.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
0.0	Code upgrade to the existing Westport Middle School facility
0.0	(District-wide grades 6-8; 380 students)
0.1	Major Renovation to the existing Westport Middle School facility
0.1	(District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)
0.2	Major Renovation to the existing Westport Middle School facility
0.2	(District-wide grades 6-8; 380 students)
A.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site
A.1	(District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)
A.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site
A.Z	(District-wide grades 6-8; 380 students)
B.1	New construction at the Westport High School site
D.1	(District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)
B.2	New construction at the Westport High School site
B.2	(District-wide grades 6-8; 380 students)
C.1	New construction at the Santos Farm site
C.1	(District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)
C.2	New construction at the Santos Farm site

	(District-wide grades 6-8; 380 students)
D.1	Addition/Renovation at the Westport High School facility
	(District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)
D.2	Addition/Renovation at the Westport High School facility
	(District-wide grades 6-12; 735 students)
E.1	Addition/Renovation at the Westport High School facility
E.1	(District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)
E.2	Addition/Renovation at the Westport High School facility
E.2	(District-wide grades 6-12; 735 students)
E.3	Addition/Renovation at the Westport High School facility
E.3	(District-wide grades 5-12; 610 students)
F.1	New construction at the Westport High School site
Г.1	(District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)
F.2	New construction at the Westport High School site
1.2	(District-wide grades 6-12; 735 students)
F.3	New construction at the Westport High School site
17.3	(District-wide grades 7-12; 610 students)
G.1	New construction at the Santos Farm site
0.1	(District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)
G.2	New construction at the Santos Farm site
0.2	(District-wide grades 6-12; 735 students)
G.3	New construction at the Santos Farm site
0.5	(District-wide grades 7-12; 610 students)
H.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site
11.1	(District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)
H.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site
11.2	(District-wide grades 6-12; 735 students)
Н.3	New construction at the Westport Middle School site
	(District-wide grades 7-12; 610 students)

As a result of further analysis, it was determined that the Santos Farm site and the existing Westport High School site would not be considered for further evaluation. The Santos Farm site was found to be unfeasible based upon the review of the Conservation Commission documents, which revealed a sloped topography, wetlands, and a riverway cutting through the site. The existing Westport High School site was also eliminated for further consideration due to the anticipated complexity of construction on an occupied high school site, the impact to ongoing education, the loss of athletic fields, and traffic impacts during construction.

In addition to focusing on the existing Westport Middle School site, the District evaluated the study enrollment options and determined that three of the five options would not be considered for further evaluation. The District-wide 6-8 and 6-12 grade configurations were found to not fully address the overcrowding issues that currently exist at the District's two elementary schools. These configurations would both require students in grade 5 to remain at the Westport Elementary School, which will leave grades 1 and 2 students at the Alice A. Macomber Elementary School, where there are currently eight modular units to accommodate current overcrowding. The District-wide 7-12 grade configuration option will maintain the current grade configurations identified above, however, it will not address overcrowding at the two elementary schools. The District determined that the only viable options available to alleviate the District's current issues

and provide improved learning environments are: (1) a District-wide grades 5-8 configuration, which would address the issues at the two elementary schools and the middle school; or (2) a District-wide grades 5-12 configuration which would address the issues of all schools in the District. The following is a detailed list of the (17) options considered in the final evaluation, including preliminary construction cost:

Option	Description of the Final Evaluation of Options	Estimated Total Construction Cost
0.0	Code upgrade to the existing Westport Middle School facility (District-wide grades 6-8; 380 students)  Cost comparison purposes only	\$50,939,188
A.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	\$74,312,530
A.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)	\$44,624,669
B.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	\$77,969,329
B.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)	\$46,467,755
C.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	\$80,171,007
C.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)	\$48,130,352
D.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	\$79,908,416
D.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)	\$47,867,761
E.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	\$77,935,542
E.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)	\$46,973,049
F.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)  Preferred Solution	\$74,188,733
F.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)	\$44,843,483
G.1	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	\$78,739,502
G.2	New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-8; 505 students)	\$47,237,928
H.1	Addition/Renovation at the existing Westport Middle School facility (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	\$82,042,581
I.1	Addition/Renovation at the existing Westport High School facility (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)  Cost comparison purposes only	\$72,004,096

As a result of further evaluation, it was determined that the District-wide grades 5-8 configurations ("Options A.2, B.2, C.2, D.2, E.2, F.2, and G.2") are not viable options and would not be considered for further evaluation because the configuration does not solve the issues of the entire District.

The District selected "Option F.1" as its preferred solution. This Option proposes to replace the existing Westport Middle School with a new District-wide grades 5-12 facility on the existing Middle School site. The proposed configuration will result in the Alice A. Macomber School serving Pre-Kindergarten-Kindergarten; the Westport Elementary School serving students in grades 1-4; and the proposed new Westport Middle/High School serving grades 5-12. As a result, the Westport High School facility would be closed. The District selected "Option F.1" as its preferred solution because it met the needs of the District's educational program while remaining cost effective. Additionally, this option allowed for the abatement and demolition of the existing middle school to occur at the same time as construction of a new middle/high school facility, resulting in a more efficient project schedule. "Option I.1" was not further evaluated because it will require multiple construction phases on an occupied site, resulting in a significant impact to ongoing education, and eliminates athletic fields.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee ("FAS") meeting on October 19, 2016. Following the meeting the District determined they needed additional time to revise the educational program and re-develop the preferred solution.

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to 11 final options for further development and consideration in the updated final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below. Please note that "Option 0.0" (code upgrade) and "Option I.1" (addition/renovation at the existing high school site) are not considered viable options, but are included for cost comparison purposes only.

## Summary of the Preliminary Design Pricing for Updated Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 0.0: Code upgrade to the existing Westport Middle School facility (District-wide grades 6-8; 380 students) Cost Comparison Only	114,570	114,570 \$264/sq. ft.	N/A	\$20,654,900	\$50,939,188 \$445/sq. ft.	\$61,636,418
Option A.1: New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$334/sq. ft.	\$16,198,715	\$78,203,449 \$421/sq. ft.	\$94,626,173
Option B.1: New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$351/sq. ft.	\$16,223,893	\$81,639,671 \$440/sq. ft.	\$98,784,002

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option C.1: New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$359/sq. ft.	\$17,320,713	\$83,873,508 \$452/sq. ft.	\$101,486,945
Option D.1: New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$359/sq. ft.	\$17,129,915	\$83,682,711 \$451/sq. ft.	\$101,256,080
Option E.1: New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$359/sq. ft.	\$17,505,504	\$84,058,298 \$453/sq. ft.	\$101,710,541
Option F.1: New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$340/sq. ft.	\$17,040,942	\$80,182,691 \$432/sq. ft.	\$97,021,056
Option G.1: New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$352/sq. ft.	\$17,040,942	\$82,456,722 \$444/sq. ft.	\$99,772,634
Option G.9:***  New construction at the Westport Middle School site (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185,610	N/A	185,610 \$334/sq. ft.	\$16,698,067	\$78,702,802 \$424/sq. ft.	\$95,230,390
Option H.1: Addition/Renovation at the existing Westport Middle School facility (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students)	185610	114,570 \$264/sq. ft.	71,040 \$382/sq. ft.	\$28,468,454	\$85,925,128 \$463/sq. ft.	\$103,969,405
Option I.1: Addition/Renovation at the existing Westport High School facility (District-wide grades 5-12; 860 students) Cost Comparison Only	191,690	36,860 \$264/sq. ft.	154,830 \$386/sq. ft.	\$9,669,848	\$79,191,204 \$413/sq. ft.	\$95,821,357

<sup>\*</sup> Marked up construction costs

Upon completion of its updated final evaluation, the District is still proposing a new District-wide grades 5-12 facility, serving 860 students on the existing Westport Middle School site as its preferred solution; however, the District has selected "Option G.9" as its preferred solution which

<sup>\*\*</sup> Does not include construction contingency

<sup>\*\*\*</sup>District's preferred option

has a different floor plan and footprint than its previous preferred solution. The proposed facility is 185,610 gross square feet, with an estimated project cost of approximately \$95 million dollars.

"Option A.1" was not considered a viable option for further evaluation because the proposed location of the building would create traffic problems. Additionally, this option would require the abatement and demolition of the Westport Middle School facility to occur prior to the start of construction which would result in a project schedule with a longer duration.

"Option B.1" and "Option C.1" were not considered viable options for further evaluation because the proposed locations are too close to the Westport Elementary School, which would create traffic problems. Also, these options are not the most cost effective solutions.

"Option D.1", "Option E.1", and "Option G.1" were not considered viable options for further evaluation because they are not the most cost effective solutions.

Option F.1, the District's initial preferred solution, was not considered a viable option for further evaluation because it created a co-mingle facility in contrast to the District's updated educational program which seeks to provide for greater separation between middle and high school program areas.

Finally, "Option H.1" was not considered a viable option for further evaluation due to the excessive estimated costs to abate the existing building for the purpose of reusing it as an educational facility, resulting in this being the most expensive option. Additionally, there would be programmatic challenges with creating a true co-located middle and high school in the existing facility.

As a result of the District's updated educational program and revised preferred solution, the District has selected "Option G.9", which replaces the existing Westport Middle School with a new District-wide grades 5-12 facility on the existing Westport Middle School site as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District selected "Option G.9" as its preferred solution because: it meets the needs of the District's updated educational program; the proposed location on the site would improve site traffic and circulation; the floor plans create a clear separation between the proposed middle and high school programs, while allowing the shared spaces to be more centrally located; and the public's access and entry into the building is clearly defined from the exterior, while providing secure separation between the public and non-public spaces.

As noted above, the District originally presented its proposed project to the MSBA FAS meeting on October 19, 2016, and subsequently presented its updated proposed project at the January 18, 2017 FAS meeting. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed a number of topics including: the District's preferred solution and alignment with the educational program; classroom locations and adjacencies; the function of the special education spaces throughout the building; location and access to the elevator; location of the kitchen; and the District's remediation plan for existing hazardous materials at the existing Westport Middle School.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) MSBA reviewed the Feasibility Study and subsequent material and finds that the options investigated are sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study is appropriate, and the District's preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District's schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the schematic design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Westport be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Westport Middle School with a new District-wide grades 5-12 middle/high school facility on the existing Westport Middle School site.

Staff further recommends that the Town of Westport (1) be allowed to consider using the Longmeadow High School as a potential model school design candidate and, (2) if the Town of Westport chooses to formally evaluate the Longmeadow High School as a potential model school design candidate, the Town will evaluate both the model school design (Longmeadow High School) and the District's Preferred Solution design ("Option G.9") and to proceed with interviews of their respective designers to determine which design best meets the District's educational needs.

,