

District: Town of Clarksburg  
 School Name: Clarksburg Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: May 3, 2017

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Clarksburg, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design for an addition and renovation project at the Clarksburg Elementary School. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	Town of Clarksburg
Elementary School(s)	Clarksburg Elementary School (K-8)
Middle School(s)	N/A
High School(s)	N/A – Regionalized at High School level
Priority School Name	Clarksburg Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-8
Year Opened	1952
Existing Square Footage	25,423
Additions	1966 1978
Acreage of Site	Approximately 20 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Mechanical Systems</li> <li>– Electrical Systems</li> <li>– Plumbing Systems</li> <li>– Building Envelope</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2016-2017 Enrollment	173
Agreed Upon Enrollment	150
Enrollment Specifics	The District and MSBA have mutually agreed upon a design enrollment of 150 students for grades K-8, for a project that will serve grades PK-8.

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	January 14, 2015
Invitation to Feasibility Study	November 18, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On May 12, 2017 Board agenda

Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on August 23, 2017
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentives points are not applicable)	61.95%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	PCA360, LLC
Designer	Jones Whitsett Architects, Inc.

**Discussion**

The existing Clarksburg Elementary School is a 25,423 square foot facility located on an approximately 20 acre site that currently services students in kindergarten through grade 8. The original school building was constructed in 1952, with a two-story addition in 1966, and a one-story addition in 1978. Additionally, a public Town library was constructed and attached to the school in 1998.

The District’s Statement of Interest identifies numerous deficiencies in the existing building including: outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; accessibility issues; and the appropriateness of existing spaces to deliver the District’s education program.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program, and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied eight preliminary options that include one base repair option, six addition/renovation options, and one new construction option as presented below.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
0	Base Repair Option
A	Addition/Renovation – Addition to West side of school; Renovation for remainder
B	Addition/Renovation – Addition to East side of school; Renovation for remainder
C	Addition/Renovation – Addition to East and West side of school
D	Addition/Renovation – Minimal Addition to East side of school
E	Addition/Renovation – Similar to “C”, but with a smaller new Gym
F	Addition/Renovation – Similar to “C”, but with new Cafeteria and Kitchen, reusing the existing gym
G	New Construction on the existing site

It was determined that “Option 0” would not be considered for further evaluation because it does not address the issues associated with the delivery of the District’s Educational Program. It was determined “Options B, D, F, and G” will not be considered for further evaluation because the costs associated with these options are too high, and the District believes that the local voters will not approve a project cost in that projected range. Additionally, the District determined that “Options B and D” are not optimal because these options propose renovating the existing wood construction wing of the building instead of replacing it with new construction.. Also, the District

feels that “Options D and F” do not fully address the educational and community needs because these options do not include a new gym..

Upon further review, MSBA staff and the District agreed to three final options (“Options A, C, and E”) for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below. Please note “Option 0” and “Option G” were not considered viable options, but are included for cost comparison purposes only.

### Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<u>Option 0:</u> Base Repair (Cost Comparison Purposes Only)	25,226	25,226 \$300/sq. ft.	N/A	\$800,000	\$8,367,800 \$332/sq. ft.	\$10,878,140
<u>Option A:</u> Add/Reno Addition to the West	34,750	21,350 \$300/sq. ft.	13,400 \$350/sq. ft.	\$2,300,000	\$13,395,000 \$385/sq. ft.	\$17,413,500
<u>Option C:</u> Add/Reno Addition to the East and West	36,150	21,350 \$300/sq. ft.	14,800 \$350/sq. ft.	\$2,800,000	\$14,385,000 \$398/sq. ft.	\$18,700,500
<b><u>Option E2***:</u></b> <b>Add/Reno Addition to the East and West – with a new gym</b>	<b>34,817</b>	<b>20,581</b> <b>\$300/sq. ft.</b>	<b>14,236</b> <b>\$350/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$2,540,000</b>	<b>\$13,696,900</b> <b>\$393/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$17,805,970</b>
<u>Option G:</u> New Construction (Cost Comparison Purposes Only)	38,240	N/A	38,240 \$340/sq. ft.	\$3,600,000	\$16,601,600 \$434/sq. ft.	\$21,582,080

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\*District’s preferred option

The District and Project Team modified “Option E”, now referred to as “Option E2” after obtaining a further understanding of the requirements for maintaining the existing drinking water well for the school.

The District has selected “Option E2” as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design because this option proposes to renovate the main school, rebuild the west wing on the existing foundation in order to minimize construction activity around the existing well, add a two-story addition to the east, and add a new gymnasium. The proposed facility will meet the needs of the District’s Educational Program, will provide operational efficiencies, and remains within the District’s budget.

“Option 0”, the base repair does not meet the educational needs of the District. Although “Option A” would produce similar advantageous results, the proposed location of the new construction

portion of this option would be located on the hill between the library and original building thus resulting in construction that would be difficult to stage. Additionally, the location of the proposed gymnasium in “Option A” would reduce the amount of natural light that reaches the classrooms in the original building. Moreover, although “Options C and G” address the building deficiencies and satisfies the District’s programmatic needs, the estimated project costs exceed the District’s budget.

The District presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on April 12, 2017. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following: the educational program and its relation to the proposed building layout; addition of a pre-kindergarten classroom; student access to the adjacent Town Library; advantages of the proposed gymnasium; programming for self-contained Special Education classrooms and a recommendation that these classrooms more closely resemble regular classrooms; potential improvements in accessibility, including an exterior and an interior ramp; the District’s plan for swing space; prior local conversations regarding regionalization; use of a temporary stage for performances; a combined art/music room; and other layouts for the art/music room and the gymnasium areas to promote increased flexibility.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and finds:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the MSBA will continue to work with the District to explore design improvements associated with the spaces and adjacencies proposed for delivery of the art and music curriculum.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Clarksburg be approved to proceed into Schematic Design for an addition and renovation project to the existing Clarksburg Elementary School for grades PK-8.