

District: Town of Marblehead
 School Name: Elbridge Gerry Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: August 22, 2018

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the Town of Marblehead, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Elbridge Gerry Elementary School, L.H. Coffin School, and the Upper and Lower Malcolm L. Bell Schools with a new PK-3 elementary school facility on the existing Bell Elementary School site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	Town of Marblehead
Elementary School(s)	Elbridge Gerry School (K-1) L.H. Coffin School (2-3) Glover School (PK-3) Malcolm L. Bell Upper and Lower Schools (Upper 1-3 and Lower K) Village School (4-6)
Middle School(s)	Marblehead Veterans Middle School (7-8)
High School(s)	Marblehead High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Elbridge Gerry Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-1
Year Opened	1906
Existing Square Footage	17,000
Additions	N/A
Acreage of Site	1.15 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: -Mechanical and electrical systems -Plumbing systems -Envelope -Windows -Roof -Accessibility
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2017-2018 Enrollment	138
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: Enrollment for Gerry and Coffin Elementary Schools: 160 (K-3) Enrollment for Gerry, Coffin and Bell Schools: 450 (K-3) (preferred solution)
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 450 students in grades K-3, which consolidates the enrollments of the Gerry, Coffin, and Bell Elementary Schools for a project that will serve grades PK-3.

District Information	
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	March 30, 2016
Invitation to Feasibility Study	March 15, 2017
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On October 31, 2018 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on February 13, 2019
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	32.47%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Leftfield, LLC
Designer	Raymond Design Associates, Inc.

Discussion

The existing Elbridge Gerry Elementary School is a 17,000 square foot building on a 1.15-acre site on Elm Street in Marblehead. Until the building was recently closed due to mechanical plumbing failures, the school had 138 K-1 students and shared administrative staff with other elementary schools in the District. The original school building was constructed in 1906, has had limited renovations and is on a small, sloping site in a densely populated residential neighborhood.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest that are associated with structural, mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems, building envelope including roof and windows, and accessibility constraints. The District has also expressed concern regarding the ability to deliver its educational program due to lack of programmatic space in the Gerry school, and inadequacy of the other elementary schools in the District.

Potential design enrollments include a K-3 for 160 students (a consolidation of the Gerry and Coffin schools) and a K-3 for 450 students (a consolidation of the Gerry, Coffin and Bell Upper & Lower schools). With the help of the Designer, the District performed a capacity analysis of the elementary schools in Marblehead, studying how the various proposed grade configurations and enrollments would affect student capacity in all elementary schools in the District. The study included addition/renovation options for these various existing schools, and new construction options on the existing site and two alternate sites.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied a code upgrade option at the Gerry School, nine 160-pupil options and twelve 450-pupil options, located on three District-owned sites and three town-owned sites. Test fit designs and traffic studies for the various sites allowed the District to narrow the decision to seven preliminary options including a base repair/code upgrade option, two addition/renovation options and four new construction options on the various existing and alternate sites as presented below:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
-	Base repair/code upgrade for 160 students at the Gerry site
160-C	Addition/Renovation for 160 students at the Coffin site
160-F	New 2-story construction for 160 students at the Coffin site
450-K.1	New 3-story construction for 450 students at the Coffin site
450-G.1	Addition/ Renovation for 450 students at the Bell site
450-L.1	New 2-story construction for 450 students at the Bell site
450-H.1	New 3-story construction for 450 students at the Bud Orne site

The District initially selected “Option 450-L.1,” a new 2-story building for 450 students at the Upper & Lower Bell site as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design due because the 450-student configuration is more efficient to operate than a smaller 160-student school, traffic congestion concerns related to all but the Bell site, and area limitations of renovation/addition options at the various sites.

The District presented its preferred solution to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on July 25, 2018. MSBA staff and members of the FAS expressed concerns regarding the proposed site configuration, internal adjacencies, area in excess of MSBA guidelines, and high construction costs. Based on discussions during that meeting, the District elected to further develop its preferred option in a revised Preferred Schematic Report to address these concerns. The six options included in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing are as presented below:

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 160-C: (160 student addition/renovation on the Coffin site)	52,814	22,465 \$327/sq. ft.	30,349 \$463/sq. ft.	\$4,811,183	\$26,192,429 \$496/sq. ft.	\$32,835,624
Option 160-F: (160 student new construction on the Coffin site)	50,055		50,055 \$459/sq. ft.	\$5,257,195	\$28,232,255 \$564/sq. ft.	\$35,083,240
Option 450-K.1: (450 student new construction on the Coffin site)	86,426		86,426 \$400/sq. ft.	\$5,102,653	\$39,653,875 \$459/sq. ft.	\$50,026,880
Option 450-G.1: (450 student addition/renovation on the Bell site)	91,522	35,464 \$275/sq. ft.	56,058 \$414/sq. ft.	\$9,758,998	\$42,725,445 \$467/sq. ft.	\$53,933,096
Option 450-L.4: (450 student new construction on the Bell site)***	82,331		82,331 \$458/sq. ft.	\$6,688,905	\$44,365,209 \$539/sq. ft.	\$56,343,815

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 450-H.1: (450 student new construction on the Bud Orne site)	86,426		86,426 \$404/sq. ft.	\$7,392,202	\$42,301,075 \$489/sq. ft.	\$53,181,682

* *Marked up construction costs*

** *Does not include construction contingency*

*** *District's preferred solution*

The District selected “Option 450-L.4” (450-student new construction on the Bell site), as the preferred solution to proceed into schematic design. The District selected this option because of efficiencies associated with a larger student population, and programming parity with the other new PK-3 elementary school in Marblehead. The Bell site was determined to be better able to accommodate traffic within its neighborhood and the two-story massing was determined to have a less deleterious impact on its neighbors.

The District and Designer presented a variation of the District’s original preferred option at a second FAS meeting on September 26, 2018. At that meeting, members of the FAS and MSBA staff discussed the importance of a continued review of construction costs, consideration of reduced window and skylight area on the exterior envelope, and the importance of consistency in presentation of the project’s scope and cost to the community.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District will submit an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s schematic design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the schematic design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the Town of Marblehead be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Gerry, Coffin, and Bell Schools with a new PK-3 elementary school facility on the existing Bell Elementary School site.