

District: City of Easthampton
 School Name: Maple Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: April 3, 2018

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Easthampton, as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Maple Elementary School, Center Elementary School, Pepin Elementary School, and the existing White Brook Middle School, with a new grades PK-8 facility at the existing White Brook Middle School site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	City of Easthampton
Elementary School(s)	Center Elementary School (K-4) Maple Elementary School (PK-4) Neil A. Pepin Elementary School (K-4)
Middle School(s)	White Brook Middle School (5-8)
High School(s)	Easthampton High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Maple Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	PK-4
Year Opened	1896
Existing Square Footage	37,233
Additions	1924
Acreage of Site	1.5 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – Mechanical systems – Electrical systems – Plumbing systems – Building envelope – Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2016-2017 Enrollment	256
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> – 195 students in grades K-4 at Maple Elementary School; – 535 students in grades K-4 District-wide (consolidation of the student population of the Maple, Pepin, and Center Elementary Schools); and, – 1,010 students in grades K-8 District-wide consolidation of the student population of the Maple, Pepin, and Center Elementary Schools, and the White Brook Middle School. <i>(Preferred Solution)</i>

District Information	
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 1,010 students in grades K-8, for a project that will serve grades PK-8.
Total Project Funding – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	March 25, 2015
Invitation to Feasibility Study	September 30, 2015
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 10, 2018 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on August 29, 2018
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	57.74%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Colliers International
Designer	Caolo & Bieniek Associates, Inc.

Discussion

As part of the Feasibility Study, the MSBA mutually agreed with the District’s intent to explore various alternatives associated with the consolidation of the District’s grade K-8 student population, resulting in the following study enrollment options:

- 195 students, grades K-4, at Maple Elementary School;
- 535 students, grades K-4, District-wide (consolidation of the student population of the Maple, Pepin, and Center Elementary Schools); and,
- 1,010 students, grades K-8, District-wide consolidation of the student population of the Maple, Pepin, and Center Elementary Schools, and the White Brook Middle School.

The existing Maple Elementary School is a 37,233 square foot facility, located on a 1.5-acre site. The original school building was constructed in 1896, with an addition in 1924, a boiler replacement in 1970, a window replacement in 1976, a roof replacement in 1991, and HVAC repairs in 2005. The facility currently serves students in grades PK-4.

The District’s Statement of Interest (“SOI”) identified numerous deficiencies in the existing facility associated with: outdated mechanical, electrical, and plumbing systems; building envelope; accessibility issues; overcrowding; and appropriateness of existing spaces to deliver the District’s educational program.

The existing Pepin Elementary School is approximately 46,058 square feet and is located on a 0.71-acre site. The facility currently serves students in grades K-4. The original school building was constructed in 1912, and renovated in 1986. The Pepin Elementary School has numerous deficiencies associated with: outdated systems and appropriateness of existing spaces to deliver the District’s educational program.

The existing Center Elementary School is approximately 16,677 square feet and is located on a 0.85-acre site. The facility currently serves students in grades K-4. The original school building was constructed in 1902. The Center Elementary School has numerous deficiencies associated with: outdated systems; accessibility issues; undersized lot that cannot accommodate sufficient parking; and appropriateness of existing spaces to deliver the District’s educational program.

The existing White Brook Middle School is approximately 130,492 square feet and is located on a 183-acre site shared with the Nonotuck Park (approximately 30 acres of school grounds). The facility currently serves students in grades 5-8. The original school building was constructed in 1972. The White Brook Middle School design is based on open concept classrooms, which the District has reported impedes its ability to deliver its educational program.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants initially studied five preliminary options that included: one base repair option; one addition/renovation option; and three new construction options. The following is a detailed list of the preliminary options considered:

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
A	Base Repair/Code Compliance – Grades PK-4 with an enrollment of 195 students at the Maple Elementary School site.
B	Addition/Renovation – Grades PK-4 with an enrollment of 195 students at the Maple Elementary School site.
C	New Construction – Grades PK-4 with an enrollment of 195 students at the Maple Elementary School site.
D	New Construction – District-wide grades PK-4 with an enrollment of 535 students at the White Brook Middle School site.
E	New Construction - District-wide grades PK-8 with an enrollment of 1,010 students at the White Brook Middle School site.

As a result of the District’s analysis of the initial options, the District determined that “Options A, B, and C” are not viable options and would not be further evaluated. The District determined that these options do not meet the needs of the District’s educational program, and do not address the issues at the existing Pepin and Center Elementary Schools, or the existing White Brook Middle School.

The District determined that the only viable options available to alleviate the District’s current issues, and provide improved learning environments are: “Option D”, a District-wide grades PK-4 configuration, which would address the issues at all three elementary schools; or “Option E”, which includes addition/renovation and new construction options associated with a District-wide grades PK-8 configuration, which would address the issues at all three elementary schools and the middle school. It should be noted that “Base Repair Option A” was further evaluated for cost comparative purposes only.

On September 20, 2017, the District presented a new District-wide PK-8 option as their preferred solution at the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) meeting. However, subsequent to the District’s presentation, the District determined it would benefit from additional

time to resolve outstanding decisions needed to refine its building layout and estimated project cost.

On November 15, 2017, the District presented a revised District-wide PK-8 option (“Option E.3”) as their preferred solution at the FAS meeting. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed a number of topics including: the appreciation for the District taking the additional time to consider the reorganization of the facility; the organization of the proposed building layout and how it will function; the current location of core spaces such as the cafeterias and media center, and the impact to adjacent academic spaces; the incorporation of sinks in all classrooms; the vision of the technology labs/rooms within the educational program, its adjacencies within the floor plans, and the potential for utilizing its square footage differently; the location of the art room on the second floor, and the lack of natural light; the increase in cost per square foot of the preferred option since the September 20, 2017 FAS meeting; and the square footage variances between the combination of two schools versus two separate schools.

Subsequent to the District’s presentation to the FAS, on December 5, 2017 the School Building Committee voted to relocate its preferred solution to an alternate location on the White Brook Middle School site, and as a result requested additional time to submit a third Preferred Schematic Report to the MSBA for review on February 21, 2018.

As a result of relocating its preferred solution the District developed “Option E.4”. The overall concept remains unchanged when compared to “Option E.3”. However, there have been some modifications to the layout of the proposed building that enhances program adjacencies and site circulation. Some of the modifications include: reducing the number of entrances from three to two; relocating special education programs (SOAR/DLC) from the upper floors to the first floor; and reducing the size of the gymnasium to provide a separate Adaptive PE area.

Based on the District’s previous presentations to FAS and subsequent efforts to refine the preferred solution, MSBA staff and the District agreed to seven options, including grades 5-8 new construction option “F”, for further development and consideration in the updated final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing as presented below. Please note that options “A” and “F” were established to compare cost and better illustrate potential District-wide costs.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for the Updated Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/ sf.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/ sf.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<u>Option A:</u> Base repair for grades PK-4 with an enrollment of 195 students. <i>(Cost Comparison Only)</i>	37,233	37,233 \$354/sf.	N/A	\$2,138,900	\$15,348,379 \$412/sf.	\$21,875,776
<u>Option D:</u> New construction for grades PK-4 with an enrollment of 535 students at the White Brook Middle School site.	96,225	N/A	96,225 \$473/sf.	\$4,480,799	\$49,604,681 \$516/sf.	\$60,529,401

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sf.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/ sf.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/ sf.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
<u>Option E.1:</u> Addition/Renovation for grades PK-8 with an enrollment of 1,010 students at the White Brook Middle School site.	178,757	115,577 \$397/sf.	63,180 \$484/sf.	\$10,703,495	\$87,189,375 \$488/sf.	\$107,593,038
<u>Option E.2:</u> Addition/Renovation for grades PK-8 with an enrollment of 1,010 students at the White Brook Middle School site.	177,746	38,993 \$458/sf.	138,753 \$456/sf.	\$10,351,716	\$91,550,338 \$515/sf.	\$112,737,317
<u>Option E.3:</u> New construction for grades PK-8 with an enrollment of 1,010 students at the White Brook Middle School site.	176,155	N/A	176,155 \$451/sf.	\$11,290,225	\$90,667,323 \$515/sf.	\$109,815,354
<u>Option E.4:</u> *** New construction for grades PK-8 with an enrollment of 1,010 students at the White Brook Middle School site.	176,155	N/A	176,155 \$446/sf.	\$11,616,284	\$90,234,964 \$512/sf.	\$109,308,415
<u>Option F:</u> New construction for grades 5-8 at the White Brook Middle School site. (<i>Cost Comparison Only</i>)	100,720	N/A	100,720 \$459/sf.	\$4,803,709	\$51,003,519 \$506/sf.	\$61,963,143

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

*****District's preferred solution**

As a result of further evaluation, the District determined that “Option D”, a District-wide grades PK-4 configuration should not be considered for further evaluation, because the configuration does not solve the current issues at the existing White Brook Middle School.

The District has selected “Option E.4” which proposes to replace the existing Maple, Pepin, and Center Elementary Schools and the White Brook Middle School with a new District-wide grades PK-8 facility on the existing White Brook Middle School site as the preferred solution. The proposed facility is 176,155 gross square feet, with an estimated project cost of approximately \$109.3 million dollars.

The District selected “Option E.4” as its preferred solution to move into Schematic Design because it meets the needs of the District’s educational program and brings the fifth grade back

into the elementary school setting, and its location on the northeast side of the White Brook Middle School site enhances site circulation.

Although “Option E.1” and “E.2” would solve many of the current issues and accommodate the District’s desired grade configuration, these options were not considered further as the District determined that these options would require complex construction phasing in an occupied building would result in significant impact and unacceptable disruption to students. Additionally, “Option E.2” resulted in a higher total estimated project costs when compared to “Option E.4”.

Although “Option E.3” meets the needs of the District’s educational program, the District determined that its proposed location on the northwest side of the White Brook Middle School site limited opportunities associated with the building organization and site circulation. Additionally, the proposed building footprint and its location on the site for “Option E.3” overlapped the existing White Brook Middle School. This overlap would require the District to provide temporary power to the existing middle school at an estimated cost of approximately \$2.7 million.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The MSBA requests that the District be available to present the updated preferred solution to the Facilities Assessment Subcommittee should the MSBA determine that an updated presentation is required. This update would ensure a mutual understanding and agreement of the proposed project scope and ensure that this scope will be reflected in the District’s Schematic Design submittal.
- 3) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 4) The District’s Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 5) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 6) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Easthampton be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Maple Elementary School, Center Elementary School, Pepin Elementary School, and the existing White Brook Middle School, with a new grades PK-8 facility at the existing White Brook Middle School site.