

District: City of Springfield
 School Name: Brightwood Elementary School
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic
 Date: April 3, 2018

Recommendation

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Springfield as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to proceed into Schematic Design to consolidate the existing Brightwood Elementary School and the existing Lincoln Elementary School into a new facility serving grades PK-5 on a new Plainfield Street site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s preferred solution.

District Information	
District Name	City of Springfield
Elementary School(s)	13 Schools (PK-5) 20 Schools (K-5) 1 School (PK-8)
Middle School(s)	14 Schools (6-8)
High School(s)	3 Schools (6-12) 7 Schools (9-12)
Priority School Name	Brightwood Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	K-5
Year Opened	1899
Existing Square Footage	55,473
Additions	1915-1916 Additions on either side of main building
Acreage of Site	1.75 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Structural integrity - Mechanical systems - Electrical systems - Plumbing systems - Envelope - Accessibility In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program.
Original Design Capacity	350
2017-2018 Enrollment	317
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 395 students (K-5), or an adjusted enrollment that may result from the examination of enrollment capacity and building condition of each existing elementary school and an understanding of the possibility for long-term consolidations of elementary schools.
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the preferred solution, the District will sign a Design Enrollment

District Information	
	Certification for 800 students in grades K-5, for a project that will serve grades PK-5.
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Undetermined

MSBA Board Votes	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	July 20, 2016
Invitation to Feasibility Study	February 15, 2017
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On April 10, 2018 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on August 29, 2018
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	80.00%

Consultants	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	Skanska USA Building, Inc.
Designer	DiNisco Design Partnership

Discussion

The existing Brightwood Elementary School is a 55,743-square foot facility on a 1.75-acre site in the City of Springfield’s North End neighborhood. The existing facility is located at 471 Plainfield Street and currently houses grades K-5.

The original school building was constructed in 1898. Additions to the facility were completed in 1916 with various improvements from 2001-2009. The City of Springfield (“City”) identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest. The existing facility requires numerous systems replacements including, HVAC and electrical. The facility lacks a cafeteria and proper areas for many programs including SPED, art, and music. Further, certain areas need to be made accessible to provide access to all students and to conform with today’s building standards.

There are 33 elementary schools in the City and many of these schools are older and in poor condition. Therefore, the MSBA requested that the City investigate opportunities to consider potential long-term, City-wide consolidation options for its large inventory of elementary schools to help the MSBA better understand how the City intends to improve its large inventory of older school facilities and how this proposed project and potential future projects fit into a long-term, City-wide consolidation plan. The City submitted its “Elementary School Facility Best Educational Use Study” (“Study”) to the MSBA on December 6, 2017 and presented an overview of this Study to the Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on January 24, 2018. The City summarized to the FAS members how it regularly reviews its elementary school enrollments, adjusts school geographical boundaries to balance enrollment across the City, and its near and long-term plans for the City to improve elementary school facilities City-wide. The City and FAS members also discussed the Educational Program for the Brightwood Elementary School and how it relates to the City’s overall educational vision; the use of subject specialists to support primary teachers in the delivery of Science and Social Studies curricula in elementary schools; appreciation for the graphical presentation of the City-wide review of existing elementary schools and plans for improvement; the challenges and importance of providing educational equity across

the City; how the proposed concept of combining the Brightwood and Lincoln School elementary school populations into a single facility with shared core spaces provides flexibility and efficiencies; the educational benefits of full day preschool for urban students; and advocating for school funding and support that could allow for the City to implement targeted capital improvements outside of the MSBA’s grant program. The City also discussed its plans for maintaining a centrally located part-time Pre-K program serving three-year-olds while expanding opportunities for full day Pre-K for four-year-olds within neighborhood schools across the City due to the recent influx of students and potential impacts to enrollment.

The existing Lincoln Elementary School is also located in the City’s North End neighborhood on a 2.14-acre site that is located on Chestnut Street. This 39,924-square foot facility was built in 1909 with various improvements from 2001-2009. The existing facility currently houses grades K-5.

In conjunction with its consultants, the City performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program. The City also received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the City and its consultants initially studied six preliminary options that included one base repair (code upgrade), two addition/renovation configurations, and three new construction options, as presented below.

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
1	Base Repair (Code Upgrade) for 325 students at Brightwood site
2	Renovation/ Addition for 395 students + 60 PK at Brightwood site
3	New Construction for 395 students + 60 PK at Brightwood site
4	Renovation/ Addition for 795 students + 120 PK at Lincoln site
5	New Construction for 795 students + 120 PK at Lincoln site
6	New Construction for 795 students + 120 PK at Plainfield Site

The City advanced “Option 1” – Base Repair at the Brightwood Elementary School and “Option 2” – Renovation/Addition for the Brightwood Elementary School into the Final Evaluation of Alternatives to fully evaluate the impact of the potential consolidation of the two schools and new construction on a new site. “Option 6” was advanced because: it supports the City’s desire to consolidate the two schools; meets the educational program; and it did not require temporary swing space for the students during construction. Although “Option 3” New Construction for the Brightwood student population on the existing site would accommodate the programmatic spaces, this Option would be challenging, site requirements would be compromised, and there would be no temporary swing space for the students during construction. Therefore, “Option 3” was not considered further. “Option 4” and “Option 5” would accommodate the programmatic needs with some compromise; however, the site requirements would not be met and the lack of temporary swing space during construction resulted in these Options not being considered in the Final Evaluation of Alternatives. After discussion with the MSBA, a new option, “Option 7”, was developed to evaluate new construction for the Brightwood Elementary School only on the new site to understand the financial impact of consolidating the two schools.

MSBA staff and the District agreed to four final options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing, as presented below.

Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options

Option (Description)	Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Constructio n (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option 1: Base Repair, 395 students	56,964	56,964 \$225/sq. ft.		\$1,487,363	\$14,304,263 \$251/sq. ft.	\$17,880,329
Option 2: Addition/ Renovation, 395 students	91,964	56,964 \$306/sq. ft.	35,000 \$482/sq. ft.	\$2,454,198	\$36,795,672 \$400/sq. ft.	\$45,994,590
Option 6: New at Plainfield Site, 800 students***	150,500		150,500 \$412/sq. ft.	\$8,100,575	\$70,166,775 \$466/sq. ft.	\$87,708,469
Option 7: New at Plainfield Site, 395 students	84,468		84,468 \$440/sq. ft.	\$4,927,743	\$42,124,916 \$495/sq. ft.	\$52,656,145

* Marked up construction costs

** Does not include construction contingency

***City's preferred solution

The City has selected “Option 6” – the New Construction option at the Plainfield site that consolidates the Brightwood and Lincoln Elementary Schools as the preferred solution to proceed into Schematic Design. The City selected this Option as its preferred solution because it allows the City to replace two small aging facilities with an optimally-sized facility that meets the City’s desire to maintain small elementary schools while benefiting from the economies of scale available through shared core spaces and educational resources. This Option provides ideal educational adjacencies, meets site requirements, eliminates the need for swing space, and replaces two of the oldest schools in the City while bringing educational parity to the North End Community.

Options 1, 2, and 7 did not support the City’s desire to consolidate the two smaller elementary schools, and Options 1 and 2 did not fully meet the educational needs or site requirements.

The City presented its proposed project to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on March 21, 2018. At that meeting, FAS members discussed a number of items regarding: the design and its responsiveness to the educational program; consideration of movable partitions that would allow for “looping” in some of the classrooms in each cluster; layout of each entryway and how the experience may be improved as the design advances; accommodating site circulation, parking, and outside play areas on the limited site; the importance of safe walkways for students; construction of the proposed tunnel; and community outreach.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study, all subsequent submittals, and the enrollment data with the City and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the City's preferred solution is reasonable, cost-effective, and meets the needs identified by the City.
- 2) The City has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The City's Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal prior to a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, with the exception of variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the City will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Springfield be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to consolidate the existing Brightwood Elementary School and the existing Lincoln Elementary School into a new facility serving grades PK-5 on a new Plainfield Street site.