

District: City of Amesbury  
 School Name: Amesbury Elementary School  
 Recommended Category: Preferred Schematic  
 Date: February 6, 2019

**Recommendation**

That the Executive Director be authorized to approve the City of Amesbury (the “District”), as part of its Invitation to Feasibility Study, to replace the existing Amesbury Elementary School with a new PK-2 facility to be located on the Cashman Elementary School site. MSBA staff has reviewed the Feasibility Study and accepts the District’s Preferred Schematic.

<b>District Information</b>	
District Name	City of Amesbury
Elementary School(s)	Amesbury Elementary School (PK-4) Charles C. Cashman Elementary School (PK-4)
Middle School(s)	Amesbury Middle School (5-8)
High School(s)	Amesbury High School (9-12) Amesbury Innovation High School (9-12)
Priority School Name	Amesbury Elementary School
Type of School	Elementary School
Grades Served	PK-4
Year Opened	1968
Existing Square Footage	53,000
Additions	1995: 6 modular units
Acreage of Site	17 acres
Building Issues	The District identified deficiencies in the following areas: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>– Mechanical systems</li> <li>– Electrical systems</li> <li>– Plumbing systems</li> <li>– Building Envelope</li> <li>– Accessibility</li> </ul> In addition to the physical plant issues, the District reported that the existing facility does not support the delivery of its educational program as well as existing and projected overcrowding.
Original Design Capacity	Unknown
2017-2018 Enrollment	395
Agreed Upon Enrollment	Study Enrollment includes the following configurations: 425 students, District-wide grades K-2 (Preferred Schematic) 450 students, District-wide grades 3-5 320 students, grades K-4, in addition to Cashman ES 470 students, grades K-5, in addition to Cashman ES
Enrollment Specifics	Contingent upon the Board’s approval of the Preferred Schematic, the District will sign a Design Enrollment Certification for 425 students in grades K-2, for a project that will serve grades PK-2.

<b>District Information</b>	
Total Project Budget – Debt Exclusion Anticipated	Yes

<b>MSBA Board Votes</b>	
Invitation to Eligibility Period	July 20, 2016
Invitation to Feasibility Study	May 12, 2017
Re-Categorization of Previous Board Invitation from Feasibility Study to Eligibility Period	August 29, 2018
Re-Categorization of Previous Board Invitation from Eligibility Period to Feasibility Study	October 31, 2018
Preferred Schematic Authorization	On February 13, 2019 Board agenda
Project Scope & Budget Authorization	District is targeting Board authorization on August 28, 2019
Feasibility Study Reimbursement Rate (Incentive points are not applicable)	55.63%

<b>Consultants</b>	
Owner’s Project Manager (the “OPM”)	NV5 Global, Inc.
Designer	DiNisco Design Partnership

**Discussion**

The existing Amesbury Elementary School is a 53,723 square foot facility located on approximately 14.6 acres on the west side of the City of Amesbury. The original school building was constructed in 1966 with six portable classrooms and a connector classroom added in 1995.

The District identified numerous deficiencies in the Statement of Interest that are associated with ADA accessibility, overcrowding, inadequate instructional spaces, undersized gymnasium, HVAC system, electrical system, building envelope, and the inability to upgrade and integrate 21<sup>st</sup> Century Learning Technology. The District has also expressed concern regarding its ability to deliver its educational program because of the size and layout of the existing facility, which currently does not allow for adequate individual and small group learning spaces.

The Feasibility Study included the evaluation of a District-wide grade reconfiguration and evaluation of the impact that may result from a potential project. The existing facility currently serves a portion of the District’s K-4 student population, with the remaining K-4 students attending the existing Cashman Elementary School. In conjunction with the design team, the District performed a capacity analysis of both existing elementary schools, evaluating how various grade configurations and study enrollments would affect student capacity within the District. This evaluation included addition and renovation options for the existing Amesbury Elementary School, and new construction options at both the existing elementary school sites.

As part of its Feasibility Study, the District evaluated the current use and enrollment capacity of the Amesbury Middle School and Cashman Elementary School. Based on these efforts as well as concerns regarding the overall enrollment projection the District requested that the MSBA re-

evaluate the agreed upon enrollment, which was originally established during Eligibility Period and certified in April 2017. The District was recategorized to Eligibility period on August 29, 2018. The City and MSBA staff reviewed updated information, established mutually agreeable study enrollments as described below for the District’s PK-5 student population.

- Option A: K-4 for 320 students, in addition to the Charles C. Cashman Elementary School
- Option B: K-5 for 470 students, in addition to the Charles C. Cashman Elementary School
- Option C: District-wide K-2 facility with an enrollment of 425 students
- Option D: District-wide 3-5 facility with an enrollment of 450 students

The District was re-categorized from Eligibility Period to Invitation to Feasibility Study on October 31, 2019 and continued with its Feasibility Study based on the updated study enrollments.

In conjunction with its consultants, the District performed a comprehensive assessment of the existing conditions and the educational program and received input from educators, administrators, and facilities personnel. Based on the findings of this effort, the District and its consultants studied sixteen preliminary options which included four base repair options, four addition/renovation options, and eight new construction options as listed below.

<b>Option</b>	<b>Description of Preliminary Options</b>
A.1	Base Repair – Comprehensive renovation of the existing Amesbury Elementary School to address facility maintenance and code compliance (Grades PK- 4; 320 students)
A.2	Addition/Renovation – Comprehensive renovation and addition to the existing Amesbury Elementary School; (Grades PK-4; 320 students) new classroom wing with renovations to the cafeteria and gymnasium wing
A.3	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the existing Amesbury Elementary School site; (Grades PK-4; 320 students);
A.4	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the existing Cashman Elementary School site; (Grades PK-4; 320 students);
B.1	Base Repair – Comprehensive renovation and code compliance of the existing Amesbury Elementary School to address facility maintenance (Grades PK-5; 470 students)
B.2	Addition/Renovation – Comprehensive renovation and addition of the existing Amesbury Elementary School; (Grades PK-5; 470 students) new classroom wing with renovations to the cafeteria and gymnasium wing
B.3	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the existing Amesbury Elementary School site; (Grades PK-5; 470 students);
B.4	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the Cashman Elementary School site; (Grades PK-5; 470 students);
C.1	Base Repair – Comprehensive renovation of the existing Amesbury Elementary School to address facility maintenance (District -wide grades PK-2; 425 students)
C.2	Addition/Renovation – Comprehensive renovation and code compliance of the existing elementary school and an addition; (District-wide grades PK-2; 425 students) new classroom wing with renovations to the cafeteria and gymnasium wing
C.3	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the existing Amesbury Elementary School site; (District -wide grades PK-2; 425 students);

Option	Description of Preliminary Options
C.4	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the Cashman Elementary School site; (Grades PK-2; 425 students);
D.1	Base Repair – Comprehensive renovation and code compliance of the existing Amesbury Elementary School to address facility maintenance (Grades PK, 3-5; 450 students)
D.2	Addition/Renovation – Comprehensive renovation and addition of the existing Amesbury Elementary School; (Grades PK, 3-5; 450 students) new classroom wing with renovations to the cafeteria and gymnasium wing
D.3	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the existing Amesbury Elementary School site; (Grades PK, 3-5; 470 students);
D.4	New Construction - New elementary school constructed on the Cashman Elementary School site; (Grades PK, 3-5; 470 students);

Based on further evaluation of the potential grade configurations, and the District’s desire to move the 5<sup>th</sup> grade students to the elementary school level; the District concluded that PK-5 for the elementary school student population, and grades 6-8 for the middle school student population best supported delivery of its educational program.

Following establishment of the District’s desired grade level configuration and further evaluation of the various elementary school grade structures, the District determined that the preferred grade structure for the Amesbury Elementary School project would be PK-2 with students in grades 3-5 attending the Cashman Elementary School. The District has indicated this new grade configuration offers students the opportunity to receive the same quality educational and learning experience through common curriculum, leadership and related services with less communication and curriculum issues between the two elementary schools. This configuration also creates staffing efficiencies, teacher collaboration and professional development across each entire grade level.

MSBA staff and the District agreed to four PK-2 options for further development and consideration in the final evaluation and development of preliminary design pricing. Since the District has not yet determined which project delivery method will be selected for this project, Construction Manager at Risk (“M.G.L. Chapter 149A”) and Design Bid Build (“M.G.L. Chapter 149”) construction methodology pricing was estimated for all options.

**Summary of Preliminary Design Pricing for Final Evaluation of Options**

Option (Description)		Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option C.1: Base Repair/Code Upgrade	CMR 149A	53,723	53,723 \$336/sq. ft.	N/A	\$1,546,696	\$19,586,532 \$365/sq. ft.	\$24,483,165
	DBB 149	53,723	53,723 \$274/sq. ft.	N/A	\$1,263,802	\$16,004,127 \$298/sq. ft.	\$20,005,159

Option (Description)		Total Gross Square Feet	Square Feet of Renovated Space (cost*/sq. ft.)	Square Feet of New Construction (cost*/sq. ft.)	Site, Building Takedown, Haz Mat. Cost*	Estimated Total Construction ** (cost*/sq. ft.)	Estimated Total Project Costs
Option C.2: Addition/Renovation	CMR 149A	99,177	13,613 \$431/sq. ft.	85,564 \$468/sq. ft.	\$6,537,720	\$52,408,066 \$528/sq. ft.	\$65,510,083
	DBB 149	99,177	13,613 \$390/sq. ft.	85,564 \$423/sq. ft.	\$5,910,052	\$47,376,518 \$478/sq. ft.	\$59,220,648
Option C.3: New Construction on the AES site	CMR 149A	98,195	N/A	98,195 \$484/sq. ft.	\$7,030,623	\$54,591,691 \$556/sq. ft.	\$68,239,614
	DBB 149	98,195	N/A	98,195 \$448/sq. ft.	\$6,506,353	\$50,520,818 \$514/sq. ft.	\$63,151,023
<b>Option C.4: New Construction on the CES site***</b>	CMR 149A	<b>98,195</b>	<b>N/A</b>	<b>98,195</b> <b>\$449/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$9,082,716</b>	<b>\$53,159,188</b> <b>\$541/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$66,448,985</b>
	DBB 149	<b>98,195</b>	<b>N/A</b>	<b>98,195</b> <b>\$422/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$8,551,730</b>	<b>\$49,957,346</b> <b>\$509/sq. ft.</b>	<b>\$62,446,683</b>

\* Marked up construction costs

\*\* Does not include construction contingency

\*\*\***District's Preferred Schematic. Specific project delivery method to be determined during schematic design.**

The District has selected “Option C.4” new construction on the Cashman site as the Preferred Schematic to proceed into Schematic Design. The District selected “Option C.4” as its Preferred Schematic because it best achieves the educational and programmatic needs for the PK-2 elementary school by providing ideal adjacencies for grade clusters, strategically locates administration at the main entrance, provides separation of core facilities and academic spaces, and supports opportunities associated with vertical integration with grades 3-5 at the adjacent Cashman Elementary School.

Although “Option C.1” (Base Repair/Code Upgrade) has the lowest estimated project cost, it was not selected because the District determined that this option does not meet the space needs or the educational program requirements desired by the District. The District determined that this option would not accommodate for the additional area required to satisfy delivery of the educational program.

“Option C.2”, an addition/renovation option on the existing site, would meet the District’s space requirements and result in a lower estimated project cost when compared to the Preferred Schematic. However, in addition to site constraints, the District eliminated this option because of the anticipated disruption associated with construction phasing and the cost associated with temporary swing space that would be required.

“Option C.3”, a new construction option on the existing site meets the District’s space requirements. However, the District eliminated this option from further consideration because of the site constraints and construction challenges associated with the site’s sloping topography, wooded areas, soil types, high-water table, and wetlands.

The District presented its proposed Preferred Schematic to the MSBA Facilities Assessment Subcommittee (“FAS”) on January 16, 2019. At that meeting, members of the FAS discussed the following topics: the educational program and its relation to the proposed building layout; grade reconfiguration; student transition and instructional methods for mitigating impact; design limitations associated with site topography; zoning setbacks and building expansion; the MSBA’s “Review and Recommendations of Best Practices for K-12 STEM Learning Spaces” report as it relates to integrating more than one sink in general classrooms; distribution of special education spaces and specialized programs; proposed use of the gymnasium for adaptive PE; the music program and its associated practice rooms and storage spaces; appreciation for the project areas outside general classrooms; outdoor access for PreK/K classrooms and layering of outdoor zones; potential benefits and efficiencies of the Designer’s previous design concepts in relation to the proposed design; site circulation, parking, and the opportunity to improve control features as the design progresses; and community outreach.

MSBA staff reviewed the conclusions of the Feasibility Study and all other subsequent submittals with the District and found:

- 1) The options investigated were sufficiently comprehensive in scope, the approach undertaken in this study was appropriate, and the District’s Preferred Schematic is reasonable and cost-effective and meets the needs identified by the District.
- 2) The District has submitted an operational budget for educational objectives and a capital budget statement for MSBA review.
- 3) The District’s Schematic Design submittal will be subject to final review and approval by the Department of Elementary and Secondary Education as part of the Schematic Design submittal, which is prior to executing a Project Scope and Budget Agreement.
- 4) Subject to Board approval, the MSBA will participate in a project that includes spaces that meet MSBA guidelines, except for variations previously agreed to by the MSBA. All proposed spaces will be reviewed during the Schematic Design phase.
- 5) As part of the Schematic Design phase, the District will work with the MSBA to determine a mutually agreeable methodology to differentiate eligible costs from ineligible costs.

Based on the review outlined above, staff recommends that the City of Amesbury be approved to proceed into Schematic Design to replace the existing Amesbury Elementary School with a new PK-2 facility to be located on the Cashman Elementary School site.